

## IMPLICATION OF BUREAUCRATIC REFORM POLICY IN ECHELON III AND IV IN THE ENVIRONMENTAL SERVICES OFFICE OF BLORA REGENCY

**Adi Purwanto**

adi\_hadinagoro@yahoo.com

Program Studi Administrasi Negara FISIP

University of Slamet Riyadi Surakarta-Indonesia

### ABSTRACT

The purpose of regional autonomy is to prosper the community by providing good public services to the community. In providing services to the public, the government uses bureaucracy. Bureaucracy thus requires employees with integrity, honesty, and capable. Along with the increasing demands and expectations of the people, the government needs to reform the bureaucracy by removing Echelon III and IV. The aim is for efficiency, effectiveness, and speed in decision making. This new policy makes uncertainty the fate of Echelon III and IV officials. This study aims to find out more deeply about Echelon III and IV reforms at the Environmental Services of Blora Regency. Researchers used descriptive qualitative methods. From the research findings, it was concluded that: a. intensive and dialogical socialization is needed; b. echelon officials who have already approached retirement age, resign themselves to government policies regarding the elimination of echelon III and IV; c. Echelon officials who are young and productive, prefer structural positions because structural positions will get more facilities and welfare than functional positions; d. staff who have the potential, diligently follow the training and have a visionary view, prefer functional positions because if you can meet the credit score, can be promoted faster, and impact on income will increase.

**Keywords:** *Regional Autonomy, Echelon III and IV, Bureaucracy Reform Policy*

### A. PRELIMINARY

At the time after the inauguration was elected President of the Republic of Indonesia, Joko Widodo stated that 5 main things were the focus of his administration in the next 5 years, one of which was to simplify the bureaucracy by cutting the number of echelons massively. The government will improve human resources during the reign of Joko Widodo for a 5-year term. The big plan undertaken by the President is to simplify the bureaucracy on a large scale. Various procedures in the bureaucracy that were considered too long carried out the trimming of positions. Trimmed positions are echelon III and IV. Based on information from the BKN (State Civil Service Agency), the number of Civil Servants as of 30 June 2019 was 4,286,918 people. Everything is spread into 4 groups. Group I numbered 44,331 people, group II numbered 779,001 people, group III numbered 2,411,029 people, while group IV numbered 1,052,557 people.

The Ministry of Home Affairs provided information that there was an acceleration of public services, including trimming the staffing echelon. The range of bureaucracy is simplified. It could also have an impact on the acceleration of public services at all levels of the existing bureaucracy in the Directorate General of Regional Autonomy. (Akmal Malik: *kompas.com*, 10/21/2019).

One of the five priorities delivered by the president during his state address at his inauguration on October 20, 2019, was a matter of simplification of the bureaucracy. In the speech, Joko Widodo considered that the current bureaucratic structure was too long. The President said the position of the State Civil Apparatus (ASN) will only be based on functional positions that require more expertise and competence. The Ministry of Home Affairs, particularly the Directorate General of Regional Autonomy, firstly observes the policies of the president and the Ministry of Control of the Bureaucratic Reform State Apparatus which is the leading sector. This reform decision was followed up under its duties and functions at the Directorate General of Regional Autonomy, especially when it comes to regional policies. It is hoped that this restructuring will encourage better bureaucratic performance going forward. In his state address, the president stated that he reduced two-echelon levels from the previous four echelons and was replaced by functional positions that valued expertise, competence.

According to a staffing expert, Tedi Sudrayat, the decision has major implications when implemented. This condition creates major implications for the institutional arrangement, management, and Human Resources of the Apparatus. That is, trimming bureaucracy is not just cutting down positions but placing a new foundation in the bureaucracy. (Tedi Sudrajat, a lecturer at Unsoed Purwokerto: *detikcom*, 31/10/10209).

Simplification of the bureaucracy must be able to put the right people in the right place (the right man in the right place). Therefore, job analysis (job analyst) must be arranged properly expressly including the scope, nature of duties, and conditions for occupying the position. On the other hand, many employees of the State Civil Apparatus are competing to occupy increasingly fewer positions. Details for the number of echelons I in Indonesia there are 575 people or 0.12 percent. While echelon II there are 19,463 people or 4.23 percent. So that the total echelon I and echelon II in Indonesia there is around 20,000 or 4.35 percent. While the Total Number of echelon I to echelon V is now 460,067 people. Many things must be discussed from the policy. This is because the implications of deleting the echelon are quite numerous. For example, regional officials such as the *Camat* and *Lurah* who are echelon IV officials cannot be erased. If the official is then replaced from structural to functional officials, it is feared that service at the regional level will be disrupted, so the scheme must be right. This means that if the district head is echelon III, the village head is echelon IV. If then there are no positions into *echelon*, then who will be responsible, for example for land management. Discussions on strategies to reduce echelon positions should also be discussed with the Ministry of Home Affairs and the Ministry of Administrative Reform and Bureaucratic Reform. The adaptation process from adjusting officials to no longer exist in the structural government, which is two years, for example, the KPK (Corruption Eradication Commission) to become an ASN (state civil

apparatus) employee, it takes within 2 years. We still have to define the right scheme. Socialization is needed for officials who then turn into functional. There are financial consequences that must be received by former officials who were echelon III-IV-V. There are financial consequences because if the officials were originally ordinary people, they would not receive office benefits. This is what allows resistance. It needs to be carefully prepared, if you exclude structural positions, it should not reduce the welfare of those concerned.

Abolition of echelon III and IV positions makes officials at that level feel not satisfied, their income will decrease after being transferred to functional officials. KemenPAN-RB (The Ministry of Administrative and Bureaucratic Reform) ensures that eliminating echelon III and IV will not reduce take-home pay, but only simplifies the organizational structure and replaces it with functional positions. Many have misunderstood the discourse on erasing the echelon. The abolition of structural positions of echelon III and IV does not mean dissolving work units, because in the regions there are interpretations like that. Such removal only simplifies the organization structurally. They can be transferred to functional officials according to their respective expertise and competence. Officials whose positions are removed do not need to worry. Eliminating echelon III and IV will not reduce the take-home pay that has been received so far. Not all important positions are deleted. For example, the position of head of an office or agency cannot be removed just like that. The interests and influence of the position must be considered in an organization. In the initial stages, the elimination of echelon will be carried out in several agencies. The Ministry of Administrative Reform and Bureaucratic Reform will first implement it as a pilot shortly.

Along with the echelon pruning, it is necessary to prepare also to build a clear career system, because changes in leaders often impact the career of structural officials. As a result, work is not optimal. The career system must be based on meritocracy, who is good, survives whoever is the regional head, whoever is the minister. Also, the welfare system must be guaranteed. Adequate welfare and benefits make ASN compete for structural positions. If in the future echelon is cut, the government must ensure that functional officials receive the same welfare. It also needs to be regulated, the protection system from the criminalization of policies, because it can have an impact on the performance of the bureaucracy. Financial governance must also be reformed. Complicated governance and procedures will be tiring and can hamper the performance of the State Civil Apparatus. The use of technology systems continues to be maximized because it can encourage the acceleration of bureaucratic performance.

From the above problems, the researcher formulated how the policy implications of bureaucratic reform in Echelon III and IV at the Environmental Service Office of Blora Regency.

## **B. LITERATURE REVIEW**

Bureaucratic Reform, based on the Peraturan Presiden Nomor 81 Tahun 2010 concerning the Grand Design of Bureaucratic Reform, it is stated that bureaucratic reform is defined as a major change in the paradigm and governance of Indonesian nations. Bureaucratic reform in this context is also seen as a big

gamble for the Indonesian people to maintain their existence on the international scene in facing the challenges of the 21st century. A century marked by intense competition not only between regions, between individuals but also between countries. Therefore, the management of government management must be changed, towards management that is oriented towards progress and strong competitiveness. Bureaucratic Reform as a process of systematic, integrated, comprehensive efforts, has a clear objective, namely the implementation of good governance and is a system that opens up great opportunities for effective, efficient and synergic governance mechanisms between the government, the private sector, and the community (Sedarmayanti, 2013: 67).

Bureaucratic Reform, according to the amendment of the Undang-Undang Dasar Tahun 1945, is interpreted as a restructuring of the Government administration system that is run by the government apparatus, both at the local and national level. According to Sedarmayanti's view (2013: 114) is a systematic approach that conceptually prioritizes comprehension rather than an extension. The plan for implementing bureaucratic reform is spelled out in the road map of bureaucratic reform which will be a guide for bureaucratic reform managers at the national level as well as government agencies in taking concrete steps to improve the quality of government bureaucracy.

Regional Autonomy, there are several definitions of Regional Autonomy. The word autonomy consists of two words, namely *Auto* which means itself, and the word *Nomos*, which means Government. Then Autonomy means self-governing; that is, self-government, in the sense of holding one's domestic affairs (Marissan, Republic of Indonesia's Constitutional Law, p. 183). Another understanding of Regional Autonomy as stated in the Undang-Undang Nomor 23 Tahun 2014 concerning Regional Government is the right, authority, and obligation of the autonomous region to regulate and manage their Government Affairs, and the interests of local communities in the Unitary State of the Republic of Indonesia system.

The purpose of Regional Autonomy, the implementation of regional government in the era of regional autonomy is directed to accelerate the realization of community welfare through improving services, empowerment, and community participation, and increasing regional competitiveness by taking into account the principles of democracy, equality, justice, and the uniqueness of an area in the State system the Unitary Republic of Indonesia. To realize the regional vision and mission, following the potential of the region, the Regional Government can form the district apparatus. Regency Regional Apparatus is an assistant element of the regent and the Regency Regional House of Representatives in the administration of Government Affairs which are the authority of the Regency Region.

Focus on Regional Autonomy, in the implementation of regional autonomy, the focus of the implementation of autonomy is at the district and city level. Therefore the district needs to improve: the quality of human resources, extracting regional potentials, strengthening organizations, institutions, and regulations to develop the specificity of regional potentials as capital to strengthen regional competitiveness to improve community welfare.

### **C. METHODS**

This type of research is descriptive qualitative. Descriptive research is research that aims to produce an explanation of the focus or topic under study (Noor, 2012: 111). Qualitative research is research that provides an explanation based on research data in the form of a series of languages in the form of text, where data are interpreted correctly and systematically to be able to get a deep understanding of phenomena or topics (Wibowo, 2011: 43). Qualitative descriptive research was chosen in this study to be able to explain the efforts that can be made to improve Islamic education in Indonesia.

Qualitative research is known as research that does not involve a calculation of numbers in the analysis and discussion (Moleong, 2012: 3), and primarily uses qualitative data, namely research data expressed in language or text form, so it cannot be tested using statistical tests (Santoso, 2006: 4). The use of qualitative data in this study is based on the advantages possessed by qualitative data, which enables the acquisition of views or knowledge that has not been previously thought or predicted (Istijanto, 2006: 37). Based on this, it is expected that the use of qualitative data in this study will be able to encourage the acquisition of research results that explain the efforts that can be made to improve the quality of Islamic education in Indonesia that has never been found and applied before.

This research also uses the literature study method, which is a series of activities relating to the method of collecting library data, both by reading, recording, and processing research material (Zed, 2008: 3). Based on these methods, the authors try to collect various documents, whether in the form of books, journals, or reports, which have valid and accurate information related to the topics raised in this study.

This study uses qualitative analysis techniques based on the following stages of analysis (Moleong, 2012: 6): 1. examine all available data, from various sources obtained; 2. data reduction, which is done by making summaries and sorting out the core or main points that have to do with the research problem; 3. categorization, which is grouping data that has been reviewed and reduced according to the focus of the study; 4. checking the validity of the data, which is done by comparing the results of data obtained from various sources to find compatibility; 5. interpretation of data, which is carried out with analytic descriptions, ie designs are developed from the categories that have been found and look for suggested or emerging relationships from the data; and 6. draw conclusions and verification following the objectives of the study and the results of the discussion.

### **D. DISCUSSION**

At first, the bureaucratic reform began since the reform era of 1997-1998. At that time, all levels of society demanded that the government immediately reform the implementation of the life of the nation and state to realize democratic governance and accelerate the realization of people's welfare based on basic values as stated in the Preamble of the 1945 Constitution. Law and bureaucracy in its development, the bureaucracy has lagged behind other fields. In 2004 the

government reaffirmed the importance of applying clean government and good governance principles. Universality believed to be the principle needed to provide excellent service to the community. Starting in 2004 the ideas and ideas of bureaucratic reform continue to experience innovation and are applied in all ministries and institutions and local governments, all must commit to carrying out the bureaucratic reform process. Following the Peraturan Presiden Nomor 81 Tahun 2010 concerning the Grand Design of the 2010-2025 Bureaucratic Reform, it was explained that to accelerate the achievement of good governance, it was deemed necessary to conduct bureaucratic reform in all Ministries/Institutions/Regional Governments. To carry out bureaucratic reforms in all Ministries/Institutions/Regional Governments, a 2010-2025 Bureaucracy Reform Grand Design is needed.

In this stage of bureaucratic reform, there are 8 (eight) areas of change including 1. Human Resources, human resource management that has not been implemented properly from employee planning, procurement, to termination will potentially result in incompetent human resources. This problem can affect the quality of government and service delivery. Therefore, changes in resource management must always be done to obtain a human resource management system that can produce employees who are professional and have integrity; 2. Mental Apparatus, mindset (mindset), apparatus mentality is one source of negative bureaucratic problems. For example, negative behavior that is shown and practiced by bureaucrats. This problem can encourage the creation of a negative image of the bureaucracy. For example, the mental in a bureaucracy that works slowly, convoluted, not innovative, unresponsive, inconsistent, lazy, feudalist. Therefore, the focus of changes in bureaucratic reform is aimed at changing the apparatus mentality. It is expected to encourage the creation of positive work culture for the creation of a clean and accountable, effective, and efficient bureaucracy that can provide quality services to the community; 3. Supervision, deviations often occur in the bureaucracy, one of which is the weak supervision system. The weakness of the surveillance system can encourage the growth of corrupt or other negative behaviors that become more and more, eventually, it can turn into a habit. Therefore changes in the corrupt behavior of the apparatus must be directed through changes or strengthening of the surveillance system; 4. Accountability, the government is responsible for the various sources given to it for public benefit, which is often the community's question. Society views, the government has not been able to show good performance through the implementation of activities that can produce outcomes (beneficial results) for the community. Therefore, it is necessary to strengthen the application of an accountability system that can encourage bureaucracy to perform more and be able to account for its performance; 5. Institutional, the community views, those government institutions are seen as not being able to run effectively and efficiently. Bureaucratic structures that are too fat and have many hierarchies cause be complicated bureaucratic processes, delays in service, and decision making. Finally, creating a feudal culture in the apparatus, therefore, changes in the institutional system will encourage efficiency, effectiveness, and acceleration of service processes, and decision making in the bureaucracy. Changes in the

institutional system are expected to be able to encourage the creation of more conducive cultures/behaviors to create an effective, efficient, and accountable bureaucracy; 6. Management, business processes/work procedures/governance in government agencies also often become obstacles to governance. Some things that should be done quickly, often have to run without a certain process, because there is no good governance system. Things like this which then forcefully created hierarchical, feudal, and less creative behavior on bureaucrats/apparatus. Changes to the governance system are urgently needed to encourage efficient administration of government and services, as well as to change the mentality of the State apparatus; 7. Statutory regulations, many regulations that are still overlapping and disharmonious, are interpreted differently or deliberately made unclear to open up the possibility of irregularities. This condition is often used by the apparatus for personal gain, which can harm the state. Therefore, it is necessary to make changes/strengthening the legislation system so that it is more effective and touches the needs of the wider community; 8. Public Services, the application of a public service management system has not yet been able to fully improve service quality, which is faster, cheaper, has legal strength, is comfortable, safe, clean, and affordable, and maintains the professionalism of service officers. Therefore, it is necessary to strengthen the public service management system to be able to encourage changes in the professionalism of service providers and improve service quality.

Based on the third stage of the Bureaucratic Reform Road Map in 2019-2025, the ultimate goal in the next five years is expected to be through the Government's Bureaucratic reform to move on to a stage of performance-based governance, and by 2025 it is hoped that the government will have moved to a dynamic Government order. The government has implemented a national bureaucratic reform program starting in 2010. Until now, the implementation of national bureaucratic reform has passed the second stage marked by the compilation of the 2015-2019 Bureaucratic Reform Road Map, which was poured into the Peraturan Menteri Penertiban Aparatur Negara Nomor 11 Tahun 2015. In the Road Map, 3 (three) targets and 8 (eight) areas for change in the 2015-2019 bureaucratic reform have been determined. The three targets of the Bureaucracy Reform include 1. Clean and Accountable Bureaucracy; 2. Effective and Efficient Bureaucracy; 3. A Bureaucracy that has quality public services. To achieve the three targets of bureaucratic reform, an area of change in bureaucratic reform was determined. Changes in certain areas within the bureaucracy are expected to create conducive conditions in supporting the achievement of three bureaucratic reform goals.

The long-term goal of implementing this bureaucratic reform is to create a performance-based government where it is characterized by several things, including a. The administration of government is carried out with the orientation of the principle of effective, efficient, and economical; b. Government performance is focused on efforts to realize outcomes (results); c. All government agencies implement performance management supported by the application of electronic-based systems to facilitate the management of performance data.

Each employee has a clear contribution to the performance of the smallest work unit, the work units above it, to the organization as a whole. Each government agency, following its duties and functions, has also measurably contributed to the government's overall performance.

#### 1. Regional Devices

Based on the Undang-Undang Nomor 23 Tahun 2014 concerning the Regional Government, has brought significant changes to the formation of the Regional Apparatus, namely with the principle of the right function and right size (rightsizing), based on workload following the real conditions in each Region. This is in line with the principles of rational, proportional, effective, and efficient regional apparatus organization. The grouping of regional apparatus is based on the conception of organizational formation consisting of 5 (five) elements, namely the head of the region (strategic apex), regional secretary (middle line), regional service (operating core), agency/support function (techno-structure), and support staff (supporting staff). Regional Office is the executor of the core function (operating core) which carries out the duties and functions as an assistant to the head of the Region in carrying out the functions of regulating and managing according to the field of Government Affairs which are left to the Region, both mandatory and optional affairs. The Regional Agency carries out the supporting function (techno-structure) which carries out its duties and functions as an assistant to the regional head in carrying out the functions of organizing and managing to support the smooth implementation of the core functions (operating core). To realize the formation of the Regional Apparatus to be following the principles of organizational design, the establishment of the Regional Apparatus is regulated in a Government Regulation, which is based on the principles of efficiency, effectiveness, division of tasks, a span of control, clear work procedures, flexibility, Government Affairs which are the authority of the Region, and intensity of Government Affairs and Regional potential. Based on the Undang-Undang Nomor 23 Tahun 2014 concerning Regional Government, the head of the Region is assisted by the Regional Apparatus consisting of staff, implementing elements, and supporting elements. The staff element is accommodated in the Regional secretariat and DPRD secretariat. Implementing elements of Government Affairs submitted to the Regions are contained in the Regional Service.

Formation of Regional Apparatus following the Peraturan Pemerintah Nomor 18 Tahun 2016 concerning Regional Apparatus is based on the principles of a. Government Affairs which are the authority of the Region; b. the intensity of Government Affairs and Regional potential; c. efficiency; d. effectiveness; e. division of tasks; f. control range; g. clear work procedures; and h. flexibility.

Following the Peraturan Daerah Kabupaten Blora Nomor 11 Tahun 2016 concerning the Formation and Composition of the Blora Regency Regional Apparatus, then in Blora in the form of the Environmental Service Office of the Blora Regency Type A, which carries out Government affairs in the environmental field. The types of positions in the Department of the Environment consist of structural positions and functional positions. In the organizational structure of the Blora Environmental Agency, it consists of: a. Head of



Department; b. The Secretariat, in charge of Program Subdivision, Financial Subdivision, General Subdivision, and Staffing; c. Field of Environmental Management, in charge of: Inventory Section, Environmental Protection and Management Plan, and Strategic Environmental Assessment; d. Head of Sanitation and Waste Management Section for Hazardous and Toxic Waste, in charge of Cleanliness Section, Waste Management Section, Hazardous and Toxic Waste Section; d. The Field of Environmental Pollution and Damage Control, in charge of Environmental Monitoring Section, Environmental Pollution Control, Environmental Damage Control Section; e. In the field of Environmental Compliance and Capacity Building, in charge of Environmental Disputes Control and Settlement Section, Environmental Law Enforcement Section, Environmental Capacity Building Section; f. Technical implementation Unit; and g. Functional Position Group.

## 2. History of The Establishment of The Blora Environmental Service

Initially, the Office of the Environment was part of the Blora Regional Secretariat's Economic Section. However, in 1993, it stood apart as the Environmental Section of the Regional Secretariat of Blora. In 2009 its status increased to become a body, namely the Environmental Agency of Blora Regency. Following the new regulations, in 2017 until now the name has changed to become the Environmental Agency of Blora Regency.

## 3. Cooperation

In realizing the vision and mission of the Organization, the Department of the Environment has entered into collaborations with external parties, namely the Diponegoro University and the Cepu Oil and Gas Education and Training Center. This type of cooperation is in the form of cooperation regarding the Implementation of Laboratory Testing, while collaboration with the Research and Community Service Institute of the University of Diponegoro, in the form of cooperation on the provision of experts at the Blora District Environmental Agency. Cooperation with external parties is carried out because laboratory equipment owned by the Department of the Environment is still inadequate, likewise with the problem of human resources. The Office of the Environment does not yet have a sufficient number of certified staff who had graduated from Environmental Impact Analysis (AMDAL) training. Qualifications of staff in charge of environmental pollution are those who have attended AMDAL training.

## 4. Environmental Impact Analysis

AMDAL is a study of the major and significant impacts of a planned business/activity on the environment that is needed for the decision making process regarding the conduct of a business or activity. The purpose of AMDAL is to guarantee that development activities can operate sustainably without damaging and sacrificing the environment, or in other words, these activities are feasible from the environmental aspect.

To understand and know AMDAL, special training must be undertaken. The time needed to understand more comprehensively about AMDAL is divided into several levels, namely: AMDAL type A training (Basic Integrated Environmental Management) is related to understanding the basics of AMDAL science. Type B AMDAL training: relating to the preparation or implementation of AMDAL

studies of planned activities or projects. Type C AMDAL Training: Understanding and exploring the assessment of an AMDAL document for a project that has been made.

#### 5. Echelon III and IV Pruning

The Blora Environmental Agency has 22 (twenty-two) echelon positions, consisting of echelon II, echelon III, and echelon IV. Among the echelon officials, some are retired, so that they are still empty, so there are positions held by other officials. If there are pruning echelon III and IV, then echelon officials who are still there, only the Head of Service is held by echelon II/b officials. Following nomenclature in Law 5 of 2014 concerning State Civil Apparatus, Echelon II/b is referred to as the Primary High Leadership Officer. Facing the government policy regarding trimming echelon positions, the staff and leaders sat together to receive an explanation or socialization from the socialization team and an open dialogue that was familiar. In this way, employees become clear and not confused and upset anymore. After conducting observations and interviews with employees, it was concluded that there were three different opinions, although in the end all accepted the government's policy on trimming echelon III and IV. The opinions are as follows: a. intensive and dialogical socialization is needed; b. echelon officials who have graduated from retirement age, believe that they are resigned to the policies of the government concerning the elimination of echelon III and IV; c. echelon officials who are still young and productive, prefer structural positions, because they assume that structural positions will get more facilities and welfare compared to functional positions; d. staff who have the potential, diligently attend education and training and have a visionary view, prefer functional positions, because if you can meet the credit score, they can move up faster, and the impact on income will increase.

### **E. CONCLUSION**

From the research findings, it can be concluded that:

1. Intensive and dialogical socialization between leaders and employees is needed regarding the government's plan to erase echelon III and IV. Hopefully, after there are open and familial socialization and dialogue, it will be clear, not confused, and upset again.
2. Echelon Official who are nearing retirement age or retire, feel resigned to the policy that will be determined by the government regarding the removal of echelon III and IV officials.
3. Echelon III and IV officials who are young and of productive age, prefer structural positions over functional positions because structural positions will get more facilities and welfare compared to functional positions.
4. Staff who have the potential and are diligent in attending education and training and have a visionary view, prefer functional positions because if they meet credit scores, they can move up the rank faster and the impact on income will increase.

**REFERENCE**

- Anggara, Sahya. 2012. *Ilmu Administrasi Negara, Kajian Konsep, Teori, dan Fakta dalam Upaya Menciptakan Good Governance*, Pustaka Setia, Bandung
- Dwiyanto, Agus. 2011. *Mengembalikan Kepercayaan Publik Melalui Reformasi Birokrasi*, PT Gramedia Pustaka Utama, Jakarta
- Marissan. 2005. *Hukum Tata N egara RI Era Reformasi*, Ramdina Prakarsa, Jakarta
- Moleong. L. J. 2012. *Metode Penelitian Kualitatif Cet. Ke-30*. Jakarta: Remaja Rosdakarya Offset.
- Noor, J. 2012. *Metodologi Penelitian Skripsi, Tesis, Disertasi & Karya Ilmiah*. Jakarta: Prenada Media.
- Mustafa, Delly. 2013. *Birokrasi Pemerintahan*, Alfabeta, Bandung
- Rahayu, Amy Y.S, Vishnu Yuwono. 2019. *Birokrasi & Governance Teori, Konsep dan Aplikasinya*, PT Raja Grafindo Persada, Depok
- Santoso, S. 2006. *Statistik Parametrik*. Jakarta: PT Elex Media Komputindo.
- Sedarmayanti. 2013. *Reformasi Administrasi Publik, Reformasi Birokrasi, dan Kepemimpinan masa Depan (Mewujudkan Pelayanan Prima dan Kepemerintahan Yang Baik)*. Cet. 3Bandung: PT. Refika Aditama.
- Siswadi, Edi. 2012. *Birokrasi Masa Depan Menuju Tata Kelola Pemerintahan Yang Efektif dan Prima*, Mutiara Press, Bandung
- Widodo, Joko. 2006. *Membangun Birokrasi Berbasis Kinerja*, Banyu Media Publishing, Malang
- Wibowo, W. 2011. *Cara Cerdas Menulis Artikel Ilimah*. Jakarta: Penerbit Buku Kompas.
- Zed, M. 2008. *Metode Penelitian Kepustakaan*. Jakarta: Penerbit Yayasan Obor Indonesia.
- Peraturan Perundangan:  
Undang- Undang Nomor 23 Tahun 2014 Tentang *Pemerintahan Daerah*  
Undang-Undang Nomor 5 Tahun 2014 Tentang *Aparatur Sipil Negara*  
Peraturan Pemerintah Nomor 17 Tahun 2020 Tentang *Manajemen Pegawai Negeri Sipil*  
Peraturan Pemerintah Nomor 18 tahun 2016 Tentang *Perangkat Daerah*