

**THE EFFECTIVENESS OF THE WHATSAPP GROUP APPLICATION  
USE PROGRAM FOR EDUCATORS DURING THE COVID-19  
PANDEMIC**

**Nur Holifah**

Fakulty of Social and Political Science  
University of Wijaya Putra, Surabaya  
[nurholifah@uwp.ac.id](mailto:nurholifah@uwp.ac.id)

**Lutfia Nurul Hidayati**

Fakulty of Social and Political Science  
University of Wijaya Putra, Surabaya  
[lutfianurulhidayati@uwp.ac.id](mailto:lutfianurulhidayati@uwp.ac.id)

**ABSTRACT**

This research was conducted based on the background of problems in the Education sector during the Covid-19 pandemic. Where the implementation of face-to-face learning is limited, it is a condition where students and teachers cannot meet in-person to maintain social distancing and physical distancing during this pandemic which makes learning to be done through online learning. Where so far teaching and learning activities are carried out conventionally, namely face to face. In online learning, we recognize the terms synchronous and asynchronous learning. The use of various applications during online learning is considered more effective and efficient because it makes it easier for users to access all kinds of information and to stop the spread of the virus. This study seeks to see how the effectiveness of the WhatsApp group (WAG) application program on the performance of educators at Wachid Hasyim I High School Surabaya during the Covid-19 pandemic. The theory used is the theory of program effectiveness and the theory of performance. This type of research is descriptive qualitative using data collection techniques, namely interviews, observations, documentation, and questionnaires. The data analysis used is the collection, reduction, display, and verification. The results of this study are first, the program using the WhatsApp group application at SMA Wachid Hasyim 1 Surabaya as the main media in online learning activities is said to be effective and efficient because the WhatsApp group application is very quota-efficient, easily accessible anywhere, and helps facilitate the delivery of information so that it can be accessed easily. coordination related to teaching and learning activities is carried out. Second, regarding the effectiveness of the program using the WhatsApp group application on the performance of educators at SMA Wachid Hasyim I Surabaya during the pandemic, it is said to have not been effective. Because the use of the WhatsApp group application as the main media for online learning activities is not optimal in delivering material and greatly affects the performance of educators.

**Keywords:** *Online, Effectiveness, WAG, Performance, Teacher*

## A. INTRODUCTION

The phenomenon that occurred in Indonesia throughout 2020 is the emergence of a new virus that is currently infecting the world, namely Coronavirus Disease (Covid-19). The Covid-19 pandemic has rapidly affected almost all aspects of human life. To break the chain of the spread of the virus, many restrictions have been put in place by the Indonesian government. Various impacts that occur significantly due to social restrictions. Not only in terms of economy, social, culture, and development. In terms of education, it also has a significant impact, schools are required for online learning or distance learning without any prior preparation. To date, the Ministry of Education and Culture has not allowed local governments other than the yellow and green zones to open schools or face-to-face teaching and learning activities. In order to fulfill the rights of students to obtain adequate educational services during the emergency spread of Corona Virus Disease (Covid-19), the learning process is carried out through the implementation of Distance Learning (PJJ) as stated in the Circular Letter of the Ministry of Education and Culture Number 4 of 2020 concerning the Implementation of Educational policies in The Emergency Period for the Spread of Corona Virus Disease (Covid-19) which was also strengthened by the Secretary General's Decree Number 15 of 2020 concerning Guidelines for the Implementation of PJJ during the Covid-19 emergency.

The principle of this distance learning activity is that students can access learning materials and resources without time and place restrictions. This distance learning activity is expected to facilitate the dissemination of materials and assignments to students. Therefore, the learning process that is usually carried out by schools face-to-face with teachers and students cannot be carried out during the pandemic. Students are required to take distance learning (PJJ), for that teachers are required to prepare learning tools that allow students to study from home effectively and efficiently. Such conditions make teachers or educators have to change their teaching and learning strategies, from the previous face-to-face learning. switch to distance learning or online learning, namely synchronous and asynchronous learning. Without any preparation, educators are required to adapt to the distance learning system during the Covid-19 pandemic.

In online learning, we recognize the terms synchronous learning and asynchronous learning. According to Chaeruman (2017), in synchronous learning students and teachers are in different places and at the same time, this is similar to face-to-face classes. One example of synchronous learning is when students and teachers participate in class through web conferencing applications. It creates virtual classrooms that allow students to ask questions and teachers to answer instantly. Overall, synchronous learning allows students and teachers to participate and learn directly and engage in hands-on discussions. While asynchronous learning is an independent learning approach with asynchronous interaction to encourage learning. Email, online discussion boards, wikipedia, and blogs are resources that support asynchronous learning. Some common asynchronous learning activities are interacting with the Learning Management System (LMS), communicating using email, posting on discussion forums and

reading articles. In addition, it is important to maintain timely feedback and clear communication to engage students in learning. Overall, asynchronous learning provides advantages such as convenience, flexibility, more interaction and to continue the responsibilities of personal and professional life. The difference between synchronous and asynchronous learning is that synchronous learning involves a group of students engaging in learning at the same time similar to a virtual classroom whereas asynchronous learning involves student-centred learning, similar to a self-study approach with online learning resources required.

Whatsapp as one of the social media is currently widely used to socialize in terms of delivering messages both by individuals and groups. The use of this media is not only limited to personal needs but can also be used to support online learning. In particular, in this pandemic period where every activity related to online learning requires not to hold meetings in person, so that one alternative that can be used is to use WhatsApp media. Basically the use of this media has a positive and negative impact. Many positive things are felt by its users. However, there are not a few negative impacts that arise from the use of WhatsApp by its users. This whatsapp media provides many features, ranging from sending text messages as well as sending SMS, saving and deleting messages and being able to directly send previous messages or incoming messages to others without having to retype them. In addition, WhatsApp is also able to carry out personal and group conversations, making it easier to deliver messages. Not limited to what has been previously disclosed, this media can also send and receive images or other files in the form of pdf, word or excel.

Then to facilitate teaching and learning activities during the Covid-19 pandemic, the Principal of SMA Wachid Hasyim I Surabaya created a program using the whatsapp group application as the main media for online learning. With some considerations that online learning using teleconference media such as google meet, zoom meeting, google teams, and others requires an excess internet package quota and requires a fairly stable signal to apply it. One of the applications that are chosen by teachers at SMA Wachid Hasyim I Surabaya as the main media for online learning and facilitating student access is the WhatsApp application. Through the WhatsApp application, teachers can take advantage of the grub chat feature. So that in the midst of a pandemic like this which is still not over in Indonesia, learning continues. In the Whatsapp group application feature, teachers and students can interact about learning without direct face to face. Through this application, the teacher can provide materials, assignments, and all forms of information to students according to the WhatsApp group on each subject that has been provided by the homeroom teacher as the person in charge. Based on the conditions that occurred during the Covid-19 pandemic and the study of several theories above, this research activity was carried out to look at several things. First, the program mechanism for using the whatsapp group (WAG) application as the main media for online learning and the effectiveness of the program for using the whatsapp group (WAG) application for educators at Wachid Hasyim 1 Surabaya High School during the pandemic.

## **B. LITERATURE REVIEW**

### **Effectiveness**

Basically, effectiveness is the level of success in achieving goals. Soejono Soekanto (1986:25) suggests that effectiveness comes from the word *effektivies* which means the degree to which a group achieves its goals. Furthermore, according to Emerson Handayani (1985:38) that effectiveness is a measurement in the sense of achieving predetermined goals or objectives. Meanwhile, the Audit Commission in Mahsun (2006: 180) states that effectiveness is providing the right services so as to enable the authorized party to implement the policies and objectives. Then, Peter Drueker in Handoko (2001:7) suggests that effectiveness is doing the right thing (doing the right things). Mahsun (2006: 182) explains that effectiveness (use) is the relationship between output and goals or objectives to be achieved. The definition of effectiveness is basically related to the achievement of policy goals or targets. Operational policies are said to be effective if the activity process reaches the final policy goals and objectives (spending wisely). Dunn (2000:429) explains that effectiveness (effectiveness) is related to whether an alternative achieves the expected result (effect), or achieves the purpose of the action. Effectiveness, which is closely related to best-selling rationality, is always measured by the units of production or service or their monetary value. Furthermore, Dunn (2000: 601) adds that effectiveness is an evaluation criterion that questions whether the desired results have been achieved.

### **Program**

The word program comes from the English "programe" which means an event or plan. Conceptually, according to the Big Indonesian Dictionary, the program is defined as a design regarding the principles and efforts that will be carried out by a certain person or group. In general terms the program is the elaboration of a plan. In this case the program is part of the planning. Often also interpreted that the program is the basic framework of the implementation of an activity. To better understand the meaning of the program, the following definitions will be presented by several experts: first, Pariata Westra et al. (1989:236) says that: "The program is a formulation that describes the work to be carried out along with instructions on how to implement it" Sondang P. Siagian (2006:1:17). "The formulation of a work program is a detail rather than a plan. In relation to national development, the work program takes the form of various forms and activities." According to Charles O. Jones, the notion of a program is an approved way to achieve goals, certain characteristics that can help a person to identify an activity as a program or not, namely: first, programs tend to require staff, for example to implement or as program actors. Second, the program usually has its own budget, the program is sometimes also identified through the budget. Third, the program has its own identity, which if it runs effectively can be recognized by the public.

The program is the first element that must exist for the creation of an activity. In the program several aspects are made, it is stated that in each program it is explained about:

- a. The purpose of the activity to be achieved.

- b. Activities taken to achieve goals.
- c. Rules to be followed and procedures to be followed.
- d. Estimated budget required.
- e. Implementation strategy.

A good program according to Bintoro Tjokroamidjojo (1984: 181) must have the following characteristics:

- a. Clearly defined goals.
- b. Determination of the best equipment to achieve these goals.
- c. A consistent policy framework or interrelated projects to achieve program objectives as effectively as possible.
- d. A measurement of the estimated costs and expected benefits that the program will generate.
- e. Relations in other activities of development efforts and other development programs.
- f. Various efforts in the field of management, including the provision of manpower, financing, and others to implement the program. Thus, in determining a program, it must be formulated carefully according to the needs in order to achieve the goals through the participation of the community.

With some of the opinions mentioned above, it can be concluded that the program is a series of actions or activities to be able to carry out in accordance with the target plan that has been set.

### **Program Effectiveness**

Assessment of the level of program suitability is one way to measure program effectiveness. Program effectiveness can be determined by comparing program objectives with program outputs (Directorate General of Traffic and Traffic, Ministry of Manpower, 1983, in Setiawan, 1998). Meanwhile, the opinion of program participants can be used as a measure to determine the effectiveness of the program. It is stated by Kerkpatrick quoted by Cascio (1995) that evaluation of the effectiveness of the training program can be carried out, including through participants' reactions to the program being followed. Budiani (2007: 53) states that to measure the effectiveness of a program can be done by using the following variables:

- a. Accuracy of program targets, namely the extent to which program participants are right with predetermined targets.
- b. Program socialization, namely the ability of program organizers to carry out program socialization so that information regarding program implementation can be conveyed to the public in general and the target program participants in particular.
- c. Achievement of program objectives, namely the extent of conformity between the results of program implementation and program objectives that have been previously determined.
- d. Program monitoring is an activity carried out after the implementation of the program as a form of attention to program participants.

### **C. METHOD**

The research method is a series of research processes to find data and facts that are carried out systematically and objectively. The general objective of this research is to solve the problem so that the steps taken must be relevant to the problems formulated in the study of the effectiveness of the Whatsapp Group (WAG) Application Use Program for Educators during the Covid-19 Pandemic at SMA Wachid Hasyim I Surabaya. There are several indicators in this research methods chapter, including the type of research, research location, data collection techniques and data analysis techniques. The research method used in this research is descriptive qualitative research. Sampling technique or the technique of determining informants in this study is a purposive sampling technique. Data collection techniques carried out in this study were observation (observations), interviews (interviews), documentation. The data analysis technique in this study was quoted from Miles and Huberman (1984) in Sugiyono (2011: 246) in which qualitative data analysis was carried out interactively and took place continuously until it was completed, so that the data was saturated. Activities in data analysis, namely: Data Collection (Data Collection), Data Reduction (Data Reduction), Data Display (Data Presentation), Verification (Withdrawal of Conclusions) so that the data collected is good enough to be used as material for scientific works.

### **D. EXPLANATION**

#### **Program Mechanisms for Using the Whatsapp Group Application as the Main Media for Online Learning Activities at Wachid Hasyim I High School Surabaya during the Covid-19 Pandemic**

Understanding online learning, online or E-learning according to Numiek (2013: 92) is a form of learning model that is facilitated and supported by the use of information and communication technology. E-learning has the characteristics of interactivity, independence, accessibility, and enrichment (Rusman et al, 2011: 264). Online learning can also be defined as a form of information technology that is applied in the field of education in the form of a virtual world. Online learning is essentially a learning that uses the use of information and communication technology in channeling learning activities between teachers and students. The use of online learning aims to increase the efficiency and effectiveness, transparency, and accountability of learning. Online learning is a model that focuses students in its implementation. This causes students to be required to learn independently and have responsibility for each of their learning processes, because online learning can be carried out anywhere and anytime depending on the available tools. Through online learning, students can explore information and learning materials according to the syllabus set by the teacher.

Online learning makes students have unlimited information because they can access information from various sources according to the learning material. Activities that students can do in online learning can be in the form of online discussions with experts in their fields, it can also be via e-mail or chat. The implementation of the online learning system is expected to be able to achieve the final results in the learning process well, be able to fulfill learning completeness, and continue to carry out educational activities in the midst of a pandemic. Online

learning materials designed by teachers determine student learning outcomes, well-designed and professional materials will support student learning activities efficiently. The preparation of teaching materials by the teacher must also pay attention to the use of multimedia tools. Learning materials can be in the form of text, images, graphics, animations, simulations, audio, and video. The selection of the right colors in the learning materials will affect the effectiveness of the learning displayed on the monitor screen. This can make online learning an interesting, memorable, interactive, and attractive learning model for students.

The application of online learning is done through several kinds of online media. The media is used with the aim that the material can be conveyed to students. Various types of online learning media include: first, e-learning-based learning, according to Faridatun (2017:2) E-learning is a learning method that utilizes web-based information technology (IT) that can be accessed remotely so that the learning carried out is not only glued in the classroom and within certain hours but can also be done anytime and anywhere. This learning is a new innovation in education which gives roles and functions that affect the world of education. Terms in expressing opinions about electronic learning are online learning, internet-enabled learning, virtual learning, or web-based learning, web based distance education, e-learning, and web based teaching and learning.

The following are some of the requirements contained in e-learning, including:

- a. Learning is done by using the network, the network in this sense is limited to the use of the internet, including LAN or WAN in the form of the eLearners.com website.
- b. Availability of support for learning services that can be utilized by students, for example CD-ROM or printed materials.
- c. Availability of tutor service support that can help students if they have difficulties.
- d. There are institutions that organize e-learning activities.
- e. Positive attitude of students and education staff towards computer and internet technology.
- f. The design of a learning system that can be learned by every student.
- g. Evaluation system for the progress or development of student learning.
- h. Feedback mechanism developed by the organizing agency.

Second, the use of video in delivering material to students is a teacher innovation in learning. The application of learning videos will help teachers in the delivery of teaching materials, and are effectively used during this Covid19 pandemic. The teacher does not have to meet face to face with students in distributing the material, but the teacher only makes an interaction from making videos to be addressed to students and then will learn it. According to Hamdan Husein (2020:78-79) the application of learning videos or courses in this case applying videos for elementary school students can be done in 4 (four) stages, including:

- a. Pre-production stage (preparation) This stage is the initial activity before video recording, at this stage it is also important to prepare for making videos that are in line with expectations (Labasariyani and Marlinda, 2014: 95).

- b. Production stage (recording) The production stage is the stage of the shooting process or taking pictures, recording sound, and photographing objects needed in producing a learning video or tutorial (Asmara, 2015:166). This recording activity can be done at home or indoor shooting aims to avoid noise from outside, optimize lighting arrangements, and facilitate the making of the video itself. The recording device used by the teacher in making videos can be with a smartphone / cellphone camera or with other modern cameras.
- c. Post-production stage (completion) This stage is the stage where the video recordings are edited so that they are better in accordance with the scripts that have been prepared (Fajar, 2017:13-14). Editing is done for the display of images in each arrangement, editing the sound on the video to make it clearer, the video display can be given text, illustration images, and also arrow instructions.
- d. Implementation stage According to Hamdan Husein (2020:7) the application of learning videos as learning media during the Covid19 pandemic can be done by sharing the video through the class WhatsApp Group. Then provide guidance to students about activities carried out in learning such as discussing video content, practicing video material, and making innovative learning media products based on the material that has been explained through the video.

Today almost all web-based interactive and allows the exchange of messages in this remote. Social media that is increasingly endemic in the world (Twitter, Facebook, Path, Instagram, Line, Whatsaap) are some examples of the intended messaging facilities (Arifianto, 2017). Whatsapp is a social media in the form of a chat application that can be used on smartphones and is almost similar to BlackBerry Messenger. Whatsapp social media is an instant messaging application that functions to send and receive messages, without being charged pulse fees such as SMS and cell phones. This is because WhatsApp uses the same internet data package as other applications. The internet data network needed to run the WhatsApp application is a 3G or WiFi connection. The features that can be used on WhatsApp are personal/group chat, timeliness (timelines) and cost effectiveness (cost effectiveness).

Some of the features of WhatsApp, including the following:

- a. Send and receive text and voice messages.
- b. Receive and send photos taken directly through the camera or in the HP gallery.
- c. Send videos.
- d. Send and receive documents (word, excel, pdf).
- e. Can make phone calls and video calls.
- f. Share location using GPS.
- g. Receive and send existing contacts.
- h. Can add or exchange emoticons both personally and through whatsapp groups.
- i. Can make a profile photo or status.
- j. Set privacy in using whatsapp

In learning using technology, students and teachers are more active and accustomed. One of the online learning is using the whatsapp group application. Where whatsapp groups can be created based on subjects at school. One of the

WhatsApp features that can be used as an online learning tool is group chat/whatsapp group. Through the WhatsApp group, it becomes an online or online study room, so that teachers and students can still follow the learning process. This is one way to prevent the spread of Covid-19 in the world of education. To be able to join the learning through the whatsapp group, members can be added by the grub admin. This Whatsapp group provides many advantages, including:

- a. WhatsApp application can be downloaded easily without using.
- b. Can send and receive messages, pictures, videos, audio and voice messages easily.
- c. Can chat with other people with a quota of more than 70 people in one chat group.
- d. Uses less data than other apps.
- e. Facilitate learning during the Covid-19 pandemic.
- f. Through the whatsapp group, the material presented by the teacher can be accessed by all students.
- g. Can have discussions about the subject matter.

In addition to some of the advantages mentioned, there are some disadvantages including:

- a. The weak network makes it difficult to download the material delivered by the teacher.
- b. The number of incoming messages, resulting in a slow phone.
- c. If the individual assessment test is sent through the group, students who have not finished can see the results of their friends' work.

#### **The Effectiveness of the Whatsapp Group Application Use Program for Educators at SMA Wachid Hasyim I Surabaya in the Covid-19 Pandemic**

The level of effectiveness of the WhatsApp group (WAG) application for educators at SMA Wachid Hasyim I Surabaya during the Pandemic Period. It can be seen based on the approach Budiani (2007: 53) states that to measure the effectiveness of a program can be done by using the following variables:

- a. Accuracy of program targets, namely the extent to which program participants are right with predetermined targets. The first indicator regarding the accuracy of program targets is said to have been effective. Due to the accuracy of the target program, the use of the whatsapp group application as the main media for online learning activities at SMA Wachid Hasyim I Surabaya is very targeted and able to share all kinds of information on online learning activities.
- b. Program socialization, namely the ability of program organizers to carry out program socialization so that information regarding program implementation can be conveyed to the public, educators, education staff, and all students of SMA Wachid Hasyim 1 Surabaya in general and the target program participants in particular. The program socialization activity using the WhatsApp group application as the main media for online learning activities has been socialized since the new school year during the pandemic, so that all students and educators understand and follow the program as a good strategy in online learning activities,

- c. Achievement of program objectives, namely the extent of conformity between the results of program implementation and program objectives that have been previously determined. The achievement of the program objectives in the program using the whatsapp group application for educators at SMA Wachid Hasyim I Surabaya during the pandemic has not been effective due to several things, first, the purpose of this program is to make whatsapp groups the main media for online learning activities, but in the process of implementation. The use of whatsapp groups as the main media is not appropriate, because WAG functions only as an initial step to start, give prologue, open classes in online learning. The use of WAG can be balanced with other learning media such as google meet, zoom meeting, google classroom, and others. So that the objectives of the program can be achieved.
- d. Program monitoring is an activity carried out after the implementation of the program as a form of attention to program participants. The last indicator regarding the monitoring of the WhatsApp group application program at SMA Wachid Hasyim I Surabaya during the pandemic has not been effective because several findings were found in the field. First, when the process of online learning activities using whatsapp groups tends to be passive. Because the activeness or enthusiasm of the educators tends to decrease. Some are only limited to attendance lists, share youtube link material, and do not recap students' grades related to assignments or discussion activities. Some findings in the field indicate that the indicators in program monitoring after the whatsapp use program is used as the main media for online learning activities are not optimal. The program is only made to facilitate online learning activities, without seeing or monitoring the implementation process of the program.

Teachers are required to have the same performance even though the learning system is done online or online. Therefore, good educators will certainly have an impact on the quality of learning in the classroom, and vice versa. In an effort to develop teacher capacity, usually coaching is carried out from schools and universities. Through coaching from the school and university, every teacher will have the opportunity to develop their knowledge (MZ & Awaru, 2018). In the online or online learning process, one must have learning facilities, not only books but also cellphones and laptops as well as internet data quota. Providing multiple learning resources for learners and in accordance with the academic and social needs of students (Awaru, 2017) good educators will certainly have an impact on the quality of learning in the classroom, and vice versa.

One of the benefits of using the WhatsApp application is that it can carry out distance learning using the voice note feature. In this activity, students and teachers can join a certain group in the WhatsApp application, distance learning can occur if the teacher cannot teach directly. The teacher distributes material to students, through the Group feature or just giving announcements/notifications. In addition to voice notes, teachers can also share material in the form of Microsoft Word or PDF text, photos, and videos. WhatsApp social media can also be used for discussions, both between teachers and students and between students and other students. This learning can be started when the teacher gives the subject

matter to the students in the group, then the teacher gives direction to the students to work on the problem. Students can also give their opinion accompanied by their name and attendance number as an identity so that the teacher can give an assessment of all students who participate in the group. In this distance learning, the teacher must be able to make a new innovation in compiling material so that it is interesting which will then be sent to students. If learning materials are not processed in such a way, students will feel bored, supported also by the absence of direct or face-to-face meetings between students and teachers, students will feel confused in understanding the material (Wildan and Prarasto, 2019:54).

### **E. CONCLUSION**

Based on the results of the explanation above which the author has described, the following will conclude some important points related to this research, namely as follows. In the program mechanism for using the WhatsApp group application as the main media for online learning activities at SMA Wachid Hasyim I Surabaya, there are several findings in the field, namely: First, the use of the WhatsApp application as the main media for online learning activities has not been effective. Because the whatsapp group application is only able to convey all forms of information to students and it is difficult to control the understanding of the material or assignment activities that have been given. Second, the use of the whatsapp group application as the main media for online learning also needs to be supported by other learning media such as google meet, zoom meeting, google classroom, google form, youtube, and other online learning media. Furthermore, regarding the effectiveness of the program using the WhatsApp group application on the performance of educators at SMA Wachid Hasyim I Surabaya during the pandemic, it is not yet effective. With some findings in the field, namely: First, there are some educators who tend to decrease their performance when the online learning process uses whatsapp groups such as being late in entering online learning through whatsapp groups, only listing attendance and sharing material in whatsapp groups, not recapping values related to results. student learning. So, even though the main learning media used is the WhatsApp group application, it is able to run effectively and efficiently.

### **REFERENCES**

- Anjani, A., Ratnamulyani, I. A., & Kusumadinata, A. A. (2018). The Use of Whatsapp Communication Media on the Effectiveness of Employee Performance. *Journal of Communication*, 4(1).
- Arifianto CJ. (2017). *Communication in the Digital Age*. Jakarta
- Basori, B. (2017) The Effectiveness of Online Learning Communication Using E-Learning Media in Automotive Body Lectures. *Scientific Journal of Technical And Vocational Education*, 7(2), 39–45.
- Creswell, John W. *Research design: qualitative, quantitative, and mixed methods approaches*. 4th ed. Thousand Oaks: SAGE Publications, 2014.
- Firman, Firman, and Sari Rahayu. "Online Learning in the Midst of the Covid-19 Pandemic." *Indonesian Journal of Educational Science (IJES)* 2, no. 2 (2020): 81–89.

- He, Wu, Guandong Xu, and S. E. Kruck. "Online IS education for the 21st century." *Journal of Information Systems Education* 25, no. 2 (2019): 1.
- Jati, P. P. (2016). Analysis of the Effect of Whatsapp Application on Employee Performance at PT. First Position Group. *Influence, Anal. Whatsapp, Apps. Performance, Against On, Employees.*
- Muri Yusuf. (2017). *Research Methods: Quantitative, Qualitative, and Combined Research.* date.
- Moleong, L. J. (2007). *Qualitative Research Methodology.* Bandung: Youth Rosda Karya.
- Nur Muqtadir Musawwir (2017) The Role of Principal Leadership on Teacher Development at SMA NEGERI 1 Galesong Selatan Takalar Regency, *Journal of Socialization*, Vol 4 edition 1, page 51.
- Panigrahi, Ritanjali, Praveen Ranjan Srivastava, and Dheeraj Sharma. "Online learning: Adoption, continuance, and learning outcomes—A review of the literature." *International Journal of Information Management* 43 (2018): 1–14.
- Rohmawati, A. (2015). *Learning Effectiveness.* 9(1), 15–32.
- Sugiyono. (2012). *Quantitative, Qualitative and R&D Research Methods.* Bandung: Alfabeta.
- Sugiyono. (2016). *Quantitative Research Methods.* Book Pandiva
- Sukrillah, A., Ratnamulyani, I. A., & Kusumadinata, A. A. (2018). The Use of Social Media Through Whatsapp Group Fei as a Communication Tool. *Journal of Communication*, 3(2).
- Trianto, *Designing an Innovative-Progressive Learning Model*, Jakarta: Kencana, 2009.
- Wahyuni, Y. L. (2016). Effectiveness of Communication Through Whatsapp Application (Study of 2012 KPI Group on Whatsapp for 2012 KPI Students). Yogyakarta (ID): State Islamic University of Sunan Kalijada Yogyakarta.