# EFFECT OF POST-TRANSITION DYNAMICS ON EMPLOYEES' JOB PERFORMANCE: THE *BANGSAMORO* REGION PERSPECTIVE

## Nabilah U. H. Madid

Administrative Assistant III, Unda Memorial National Agricultural School, Ministry of Basic, Higher, and Technical Education, Philippines nabilah.hmadid1994@gmail.com;

## Yammie P. Daud

Faculty, College of Public Administration and Governance Bukidnon State University, Philippines yammiedaud@buksu.edu.ph;

## **ABSTRACT**

This study evaluates the job performance of government employees during the transition period from the Autonomous Region in Muslim Mindanao (ARMM) to the *Bangsamoro* Autonomous in Muslim Mindanao (BARMM). It specifically attempts to determine the employees' job performance regarding efficiency, timeliness, and responsiveness. This study used a descriptive quantitative method to analyze the data gathered. It also employed a qualitative approach in analyzing and interpreting the data. A convenient sampling method was employed in the data gathering. Key informants' interview was also employed to extract raw data from the participants. Essential statistical tools like mean and standard deviation were also resorted to in the data treatment. The study results revealed that the employees performed well on the three variables. However, timeliness was found to have the lowest mean among the variables. The finding implies that statement indicators under this variable could have been performed better by the employees during the transition period.

**Keywords:** Job Performance, Post-transition, Bangsamoro Governance

# A. INTRODUCTION

Public administration encompasses a wide-ranging discipline, which includes, among others, human resources management. Accordingly, human resources management is an essential aspect of every organization. With human resources management, any organization or corporation, be it public or private, could effectively recruit and retain employees, thus improving and enhancing the organizational culture and development for the betterment of that organization. In addition, public organizations like local government units (LGUs) could only maintain a healthy working environment with adequate human resources management. In particular, LGUs like the *Bangsamoro* Autonomous in Muslim Mindanao (BARMM), the defunct Autonomous Region in Muslim Mindanao (ARMM), and human resource management are of imperious need. With competitive hiring and selection of employees by prescribed Civil Service Commission (CSC) rules and regulations, BARMM's organizational development was possible.

One of the manifestations of the national government in its effort to foster equitable and sustainable economic growth, as well as ensure full and productive employment and decent work opportunities for everyone, the Philippines is among the one hundred ninety-three (193) United Nations (U.N.) signatories and member-states that have chosen to endorse the U.N.'s Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), which were approved on September 25, 2015. To adhere to the SDG's goal of a sustainable working environment, the BARMM had to reorganize the region's workforce. It was in early 2019 that ARMM transitioned to BARMM, wherein the constituents of the region actively participated in the plebiscite. This plebiscite resulted in the ratification of the *Bangsamoro* organic law (BOL) and thus initiated the transition of authority from the previous regional government ARMM to the newly established BARMM, effectively dissolving the previous regional government of the ARMM. The creation of BARMM revived the aspirations of the Muslim minority in the southern Philippines (Alonto, 2022). After seventeen (17) years of formal discussions between the Philippine government and the Moro Islamic Liberation Front (MILF), hope for enduring peace and advancement was bolstered.

The transition period for establishing the Bangsamoro Autonomous Region shall commence upon the ratification of this Organic Law (sec.1, RA 11054). A Bangsamoro Transition Authority (BTA) will be the interim government in the Bangsamoro Autonomous Region during the transition period. The Moro Islamic Liberation Front (MILF) shall lead the BTA without prejudice to the participation of the MILF in its membership (sec.2, ibid). Within the first sixty (60) days of the transition period, the interim Chief Minister shall submit to the BTA a transitory plan containing the proposed organizational plan and the implementation schedule (sec. 6, ibid). There shall be composed of fifteen (15) primary ministries with suboffices, namely Finance, and Budget and Management; Social Services; Trade, Investments, and Tourism; Labor and Employment; Transportation and Communications; Basic, Higher and Technical Education; Indigenous Peoples' Affairs; Health; Public Works; Local Government; Environment, Natural Resources, and Energy; Human Settlement and Development; Science and Technology; Agriculture, Fisheries, and Agrarian Reform; and Public Order and Safety. Other offices on youth, women settlers, communities, disaster risk reduction and management, and planning and development, among others, may be created by the Bangsamoro Transition Authority (sec. 8, ibid.). Because of the creation of these 15 ministries mentioned above, each with its own human resources management, a massive rationalization and reorganization took place.

As a result of these massive reorganization, more than 500 permanent employees of the defunct ARMM had underwent phasing out of their job which started last November 2019 until the last day of December of the same year. During this transition period, numerous changes and reforms were instituted. One of the notable and historic changes which transpired is the employees in the sectors of health, education, and social welfare were absorbed and transferred to the present *bangsamoro* government because of the establishment of these 15 ministries. With the implementation of these massive reorganizations, the employees' job performance has been dramatically affected by the nature of their

appointments and the security of their tenure. The three dimensions of efficiency, timeliness, and responsiveness to the delivery of services is the core of this sociological inquiry. This empirical inquiry delves on the effect of transition dynamics from defunct ARMM to BARRM specifically on the employees' job performance on the three-dimension mentioned above. Further, this study could also be the basis for policymakers to propose appropriate human interventions to address the peculiar needs of the present BARMM employees.

# B. LITERATURE REVIEW Employees' job performance

Employee performance is a benchmark for a person's success in carrying out its duties. Performance influenced by several factors, both from the employees themselves are self-motivation, as well as from outside himself as leadership and remuneration (Zulkarnain, 2016). Job performance comprises a set of objectives and observable and measurable actions under the worker's control, whose purposes are shared with the organization's demands (Sandall et al., 2022). Job performance is one of most businesses' measures to ensure their business is sustainable, lucrative, and expandable (Adam et al., 2023). Employee performance refers to the amount and quality of work an employee completes to fulfill their assigned tasks. Integrating Islamic concepts into human resource management (HRM) can help institutions and companies overcome their issues (Abbazi & Zargan, 2019). In addition, employee performance also refers to a person's success during a specific period in carrying out tasks compared to various possibilities, such as work standards, targets, goals, and criteria. The employee's performance is affected by the work environment, quality of work-life, and organizational commitment (Karoso, S. et. al. (2022). Practical implementation proposes that providing decent wage packages and adequate welfare facilities that can be strategized and implemented will enhance productivity (Alam et al. (2020). In addition, school welfare provisions will positively influence teacher performance if teachers are reciprocally committed to work while administrators meet teachers' varied needs (Rwigema, 2022). A happy and satisfied employee will reciprocate by performing their best (Alam et al., 2020).

## **Efficiency**

Efficiency is the degree to which resources are employed to accomplish a goal with the least waste, expense, or labor. Applying principles from lean methodologies to eliminate waste, reduce time, and improve overall efficiency in operations and processes; designing workflows and systems that facilitate smooth and efficient task execution, communication, and collaboration; enhancing channels, methods, and practices to ensure clarity, transparency, and effectiveness in conveying information and facilitating collaboration; and identifying and streamlining processes to eliminate unnecessary steps, reduce redundancies, and increase productivity in the work output, are some of the indicators that work efficiency can be achieved. It could be either economic efficiency, business efficiency, or public sector efficiency. In this study, public sector efficiency is applicable. Accordingly, public sector efficiency is the ability of government agencies and public institutions to deliver services and achieve objectives with the

least number of resources. Efficiency in the public sector involves minimizing waste and optimizing processes to provide maximum value to the public (OECD, 2010).

Efficiency positively affects success by improving employee work satisfaction (Anwar & Abd Zebari, 2015). Appreciating employees raises morale, which improves productivity across the board for the business. The leader's behavior viz-a-vis leadership style adopted, acceptance from colleagues, and compensation affects the working efficiency of the workers (Lecharoen & Akkawanitcha, 2019). The relationship between the supervisor and subordinate is the main factor affecting job satisfaction and employee performance (Tsitmideli et al. (2017).

#### **Timeliness**

In Public Administration, timeliness is critical for efficiently delivering public services. It involves adhering to policy implementation and service delivery schedules, which impacts public trust and satisfaction (Frederickson & Smith, 2003). On the one hand, timeliness, as used in this study, emphasizes the importance of timely and responsive communication to facilitate collaboration and decision-making. Reliability and timeliness are two essential elements in financial information for the correct decision-making. Human resources' capacity significantly influences the reliability and timeliness of financial reporting in the local governments in the Special Region of Yogyakarta Province (Oktyawati & Fajri, 2019). Timeliness also includes anticipating future tasks, events, or deadlines and proactively planning to allocate ample time and resources to meet the demands.

Regarding job performance, timeliness is the degree to which duties and responsibilities are finished within predetermined periods and deadlines. Total productivity, efficiency, and organizational effectiveness are crucial to job performance. Timeliness is a service that allows staff members to handle critical client interactions promptly without escalating the difficulties to other staff members. It is crucial since it will enable the business to combat the unfavorable perceptions of its services being spread. The timeliness dimension at the Bone Regency Population and Civil Registration Service, Indonesia, revealed that it is suboptimal. Factors contributing to this include the complexity of document processing, inadequate technological support, and poor time management (Nawawi & Lambali, 2023). One of the three qualitative traits an organization should have is timeliness; however, this is only sometimes the case (Seyam et al., 2016). First, the relative complexity of bureaucratic standards is a significant factor in the impairment of timeliness; as a result, having management personnel with the necessary qualifications who have received specialized training in standard interpretation and implementation is needed.

Furthermore, more internal controls result in better communication and an effective reporting procedure. All governments, no matter how big or small, must release pertinent information promptly—usually within six months. Thirdly, employees find it challenging to understand sophisticated data obtained from consultants. Last but not least, a fundamental issue with this study is management turnover. A more specific example is timeliness in budgeting. Accordingly,

budgeting timeliness plays a significant role in government financial management. The findings demonstrate that internal audit functions' capability, maturity, expertise, and legislative coalition positively affect budgeting timelines (Sahari et al., 2022).

# Responsiveness

Responsiveness is at the heart of effective and accountable governance. Unless the government acts responsibly and is responsive to local conditions and demands, constitutional rights remain unrealized, and trust in government and the political system is eroded (UNDESA, 2015). According to Frederickson and Smith (2003), responsiveness in public administration is the ability of government agencies to react promptly and effectively to citizens' needs and demands. This concept is essential for maintaining public trust and ensuring the efficient delivery of services. In addition, it is a principle of administrative accountability towards clients and customers (Zainal et al., 2018). With the passage and approval of the Local Government Code of 1991 (RA 7160, 2021), the delivery of essential services to the constituents has been devolved to the local government units (LGUs) like BARMM. Public service delivery is the main component of the government that exemplifies the responsiveness function that connects the public and local authorities. LGUs or the BARMM government, being the service provider to the public at their localities, fast response is a vital ingredient to ensure public confidence and trust, which simultaneously leads to work quality (Zainal et al., 2018). Thus, the responsiveness of local government affects the joyous communion between these two stakeholders. According to Reis and Gable (2015), responsiveness is the key factor that underlies many fundamental attributes associated with contentment and positive relationships. It also helps shape organizational performance, especially in how healthy organizations are governed and the level of value they provide to consumers and other stakeholders (Sari et al., 2020). Moreover, Chao and Spillan (2010) argued that responsiveness pertains to an organization's capacity to promptly adapt to any alterations in the setting that could impact its operations. Also, it depends on the organization's ability to promptly adapt to environmental changes, resulting in customer retention and creating value for customers (Sahi et al., 2019).

### C. METHOD

The study employed the descriptive quantitative research method. Descriptive research can involve quantitative methods that collect measurable data for statistical analysis of a sample population. Numbers can reveal patterns, relationships, and trends throughout time and can be identified through surveys, polls, and experiments (Holton & Burnett, 2005). A qualitative approach was also used to analyze and interrogate the data collected. Document analysis was utilized for the readily available materials. The participants were one hundred fifty (150) employees from different ministry units who were randomly selected. This study used convenience sampling, a non-probability sampling technique. Although non-probability sampling has many limitations due to the subjective nature of choosing the sample, and thus, it could be a better representative of the population, it is valid, especially when randomization is impossible, like when the

population is enormous. It can be helpful when the researcher has limited resources, time, and workforce (Etikan et al., 2016). The study utilized a researcher-made survey questionnaire crafted purposely for this study. The data gathering commenced right after the study permit had been approved. Ethical considerations were strictly observed for the entire duration of the data gathering. Data privacy was also observed, and the utmost care was given to the data from the participants. Essential statistical tools like mean and standard deviation were also resorted to in the data treatment.

### **D. EXPLANATION**

## Post-transition employees' job performance in terms of efficiency

Efficiency is the degree to which resources are employed to accomplish a goal with the least waste, expense, or labor. Some indicators of work efficiency include applying principles from lean methodologies to eliminate waste, reduce time, and improve overall efficiency in operations and processes, as well as identifying and streamlining processes to eliminate unnecessary steps, reduce redundancies, and increase productivity in the work output.

Table 1 below demonstrates the mean and standard deviation of government employees' job performance for efficiency.

**Table 1** *Mean and standard deviation on job performance of government employees for efficiency* 

Statement Indicator	Mean	Standard Deviation	Qualitative Description	Qualifying Statement
1. Applying principles from lean methodologies to eliminate waste, reduce cycle times, and improve overall efficiency in operations and processes.	3.84	0.74	Very Good Performance	Government employees have 60-79% or very good performance during the transition period.
2. Designing workflows and systems that facilitate smooth and efficient task execution, communication, and collaboration.	3.83	0.73	Very Good Performance	Government employees have 60-79% or very good performance during the transition period.
3. I always show high reliability when performing my work.	3.80	0.76	Very Good Performance	Government employees have 60-79% or very good performance during the transition period.
4. Enhancing channels, methods, and practices to ensure clarity, transparency, and effectiveness in conveying information and	3.80	0.74	Very Good Performance	Government employees have 60-79% or very good performance during the transition period.

faci	litating	colla	boration.
raci	manng	COHa	ooranon.

5. Identifying and stream processes to eliminate unnecessary steps, reduce redundancies, and increasoroductivity in my work	ce ase	3.77	0.76	Very Good Performance	Government employees have 60-79% or very good performance during the transition period.
Total		3.81	0.74	Very Good Performance	Government employees have 60-79% or very good performance during the transition period.
Legend:					
Scale	Mean		Qualitative	e	
	Interval	Description			
1	1.00-1.49	Poor Performance			
2	1.50-2.49	Fair Performance			
3	2.50-3.49	Good Performance		ance	
4	3.50-4.49	Very Good		d	
		Performance			
5	4.50-5.00	Excellent			

As can be gleaned from Table 1, a typically high mean score and a consistent standard deviation only show that the government personnel performed exceptionally well during the transition phase. Workers consistently and successfully perform excellently in implementing lean approaches to increase efficiency. They consistently deliver consistent results by efficiently building processes and systems that support efficient task execution and teamwork. There needs to be more variation in the work's reliability, which is constantly high. Enhancement efforts successfully keep performance stable and excellent through collaboration and communication channels. More diversity is also observed in the procedures that staff effectively optimize to reduce redundancy and boost productivity. The result above was corroborated by related literature. Efficiency positively affects success by improving employee work satisfaction (Anwar & Abd Zebari, 2015). Appreciating employees raises morale, which improves productivity across the board for the business. The leader's behavior, including the leadership style, adopted, acceptance from colleagues, and compensation affects the workers' working efficiency (Lecharoen & Akkawanitcha, 2019).

Performance

# Post-transition employees' job performance in terms of timeliness

Timeliness is critical for efficiently delivering public services. It involves adhering to policy implementation and service delivery schedules, which impacts public trust and satisfaction (Frederickson & Smith, 2003). Timeliness also includes anticipating future tasks, events, or deadlines and proactively planning to allocate ample time and resources to meet the demands.

Table 2 illustrates the mean and standard deviation of government employees' job performance for timeliness.

**Table 2** *Mean and standard deviation on job performance of government employees for timeliness* 

Statement Indicator		Mean	Standard Deviation	_	itative ription	Qualifying Statement
1. Emphasizing the importance of timely and responsive communication to facilitate collaboration, decision-making, and problem-solving.	3.81	0.71	Very ( Perfori	Good	Governm have 60-7	ent employees '9% or very good nce during the
2. Anticipating future tasks, events, or deadlines and proactively planning and allocating time and resources to address them in advance.	3.79	0.77	Very ( Perfori		have 60-7	ent employees 19% or very good nee during the period.
3. Cultivating habits and behaviors prioritizing arriving or delivering on time for meetings, appointments, and commitments.	3.76	0.79	Very ( Perfori		have 60-7	ent employees 19% or very good nce during the period.
4. Implementing time-blocking techniques to allocate dedicated time slots for specific tasks or activities, ensuring focused and uninterrupted work.	3.75	0.78	Very ( Perfori		have 60-7	ent employees 19% or very good nee during the period.
5. My bosses depend on me because I can always deliver any task given to me on time.	3.66	0.82	Very ( Perform		have 60-7	ent employees 19% or very good nce during the period.
Total	3.75	0.77	Very ( Perfori		have 60-7	ent employees 19% or very good nce during the period.
Legend:						
Scale Mean Interval	Qualitative Description					
1 1.00-1.49	Poor Performance					
2 1.50-2.49						
3 2.50-3.49						
4 3.50-4.49						
5 4.50-5.00	Performance 0 Excellent Performance					

The average score for all government workers during the transition period is very high, and the standard deviation has remained static. Workers strongly emphasize responsive and timely communication, which promotes high consistency and effective collaboration and decision-making. Despite occasional fluctuations in performance, they consistently plan for upcoming work and manage resources effectively, maintaining a very high-performance level. Developing punctual routines and behaviors has also been a top focus, demonstrating consistent and reliable performance. By putting time-blocking strategies into practice, work can be done with stability and attention. Furthermore, workers may be counted on to complete assignments on schedule, but there is a little more variation in this area. The findings show that government workers exhibit high competence and consistency and perform exceptionally well in all evaluated categories.

Some existing literature substantiated the results. Accordingly, reliability and timeliness are two essential elements in financial information for the correct decision-making. Human resources capacity significantly influences the reliability and timeliness of financial reporting in the local governments in the Special Region of Yogyakarta Province (Oktyawati & Fajri, 2019). Timeliness is a service that allows staff members to handle critical client interactions promptly without escalating the difficulties to other staff members. It is crucial since it will enable the business to combat the unfavorable perceptions of its services being spread (Nawawi & Lambali, 2023).

# Post-transition employees' job performance in terms of responsiveness

Responsiveness is at the heart of effective and accountable governance. According to Frederickson and Smith (2003), responsiveness in public administration is the ability of government agencies to react promptly and effectively to citizens' needs and demands. This concept is essential for maintaining public trust and ensuring the efficient delivery of services.

Below is Table 3, which reflects the mean and standard deviation of government employees' job performance for responsiveness.

**Table 3** *Mean and standard deviation on job performance of government employees for responsiveness* 

Statement Indicator	Mean	Standard	Qualitative	Qualifying Statement
		Deviation	Description	
1. Providing prompt and attentive	3.84	0.77	Very Good	Government employees
assistance to customers' inquiries,			Performance	have 60-79% or very good
concerns, and requests to ensure				performance during the
a positive experience.				transition period.
2. Respond promptly to team	3.84	0.73	Very Good	Government employees
members' requests for assistance,			Performance	have 60-79% or very good
input, or collaboration to foster a				performance during the
culture of cooperation and				transition period.
support.				

3. Following up promp previous interactions, commitments, or agree ensure that tasks are co and expectations are m	ements to ompleted	3.82	0.77	Very Good Performance	Government employees have 60-79% or very good performance during the transition period.	
4. Acknowledging and responding promptly to colleague, or stakehold feedback demonstrates attentiveness and willing address concerns.	customer, ler	3.77	0.82	Very Good Performance	Government employees have 60-79% or very good performance during the transition period.	
5. Respond promptly to messages, and other fo communication to main and effective interaction channels.	rms of ntain open	3.76 0.81 Very Good Performance		•	Government employees have 60-79% or very good performance during the transition period.	
Total		3.81	0.78	Very Good Performance	Government employees have 60-79% or very good performance during the transition period.	
Legend:						
Scale	Mean	Qualitative Description				
1	Interval	Do	on Donform			
1 2	1.00-1.49 1.50-2.49	Poor Performance Fair Performance				
3	2.50-3.49		od Perform			
4	3.50-4.49	Very (				
5	4.50-5.00	Excel				
ě	0 2.00					

Based on the table above, the government workers performed very well across several indicators with a qualitative description of "very good performance." For example, employees did a great job ensuring their clients had a good experience by attending to their queries promptly. The responsive reply of the government employees to the assistance needed by the other team members also showed a strong collaborative and cooperative culture. Their ability to follow up on prior requests and queries demonstrates their dedication to meeting expectations. Workers were open to constructive criticism and eager to resolve problems quickly. The findings demonstrate that government workers perform consistently amidst the transition period.

The findings of the study were supported by related literature. Public service delivery is the main component of the government that exemplifies the responsiveness function that connects the public and local authorities. LGUs or

the BARMM government, being the service provider to the public at their localities, fast response is a vital ingredient to ensure public confidence and trust, which simultaneously leads to work quality (Zainal et al., 2018). According to Reis and Gable (2015), responsiveness is the key factor that underlies many fundamental attributes associated with contentment and positive relationships. It also helps shape organizational performance, especially in how healthy organizations are governed and the level of value they provide to consumers and other stakeholders (Sari et al., 2020). Moreover, Chao and Spillan (2010) argued that responsiveness pertains to an organization's capacity to promptly adapt to any alterations in the setting that could impact its operations. Also, it depends on the organization's ability to promptly adapt to environmental changes, resulting in customer retention and creating value for customers (Sahi et al., 2019).

In sum, the core of this empirical inquiry is to highlight the transition from ARMM to BARMM offering a unique lens to comprehend on how the post-transition administrative changes influence organizational dynamics. This transition could be considered as one of the historic and notable administrative events in Philippine governance, thus showcasing a fresh perspective on the impacts of transition regional governance. This explicit governance context is relatively underexplored, making this sociological inquiry mainly relevant for understanding regional governance changes.

## E. CONCLUSION

Based on the analysis and interpretation of the data collected, efficiency and responsiveness gained the highest mean and standard deviation, while the timeliness dimension gained the lowest mean. Although the overall rating is "very good performance," one cannot immediately conclude that the job performance of the government employees is exceptionally very good. The results show that appropriate intervention is still needed for the present BARMM government to thrive and attain its development. In particular, timeliness garnered the lowest mean with two identified gaps to be filled, namely delays due to transition-related disruptions and communication barriers. These could be readily addressed by developing computerized tracking systems, which will result in the timely completion of tasks and assignments with strict adherence to deadlines. In sum, the present sociological inquiry not only maps the current state of employees' job performance during the transition period but may also serve as a guide for policymakers to propose and enact policies that will enhance organizational effectiveness in government settings, particularly in the region. It is recommended that a series of capability-building development trainings and seminars relative to technological advancements and updated standard bureaucratic procedures be conducted in due time to uplift the quality of human resource management in the region.

## REFERENCES

Abbazi, U., & Zarqan, I. A. (2019). Islamic pedagogy on human resource management based on Islamic references. Journal of Islamic Business and Economic Review, 2(1), 34-42.

- Adam, A., Razak, N.S.A., Alshurideh, M.T. (2023). The Effect of Virtual Working Team on Job Performance: A Study of Aerospace Manufacturing Industry in Malaysia. In: Alshurideh, M., Al Kurdi, B.H., Masa'deh, R., Alzoubi, H.M., Salloum, S. (eds) The Effect of Information Technology on Business and Marketing Intelligence Systems. Studies in Computational Intelligence, vol 1056. Springer, Cham. <a href="https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-031-12382-5\_68">https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-031-12382-5\_68</a>.
- Alam, M. N., Hassan, M. M., Bowyer, D., & Reaz, M. (2020). The effects of wages and welfare facilities on employee productivity: Mediating role of employee work motivation. Australasian Accounting, Business and Finance Journal, 14(4), 38-60.
- Anwar, G., & Abd Zebari, B. (2015). The Relationship between Employee Engagement and Corporate Social Responsibility: A Case Study of Car Dealership in Erbil, Kurdistan. International Journal of Social Sciences & Educational Studies, 2(2), 45.
- Chao, M. C. H., & Spillan, J. E. (2010). The journey from market orientation to firm performance: A comparative study of U.S. and Taiwanese SMEs. Management Research Review, 33(5), 472-483.
- CSC MC 01, s. 2021: Program to Institutionalize Meritocracy and Excellence in Human Resource Management (PRIME-HRM): Revised Guidelines on the Conferment of H.R. Recognition and Award," CIVIL SERVICE GUIDE: A Compilation of Issuances on Philippine Civil Service, accessed May 30, 2024, <a href="https://www.csguide.org/items/show/1437">https://www.csguide.org/items/show/1437</a>.
- Etikan, I., Musa, S. A., and Alkassim, R. S. (2016). Comparison of Convenience Sampling and Purposive Sampling. American Journal of Theoretical and Applied Statistics. Vol. 5, No. 1, 2016, pp. 1-4. doi: 10.11648/j.ajtas.20160501.11.
- Frederickson, H. G., & Smith, K. B. (2003). *The Public Administration Theory Primer*. Westview Press.
- Holton, E. F., & Burnett, M. F. (2005). The basics of quantitative research. Research in organizations: Foundations and methods of inquiry, 29-
- Karoso, S., et. al. (2022). Analyzing the Relationship of Work Environment and Quality of Work Life on Employee Performance: The Mediating Role of Organizational Commitment. Journal of Madani Society, 1(3), 167–173. https://doi.org/10.56225/jmsc.v1i3.140.
- Lecharoen, N., & Akkawanitcha, C. (2019). Factors Affecting Job Satisfaction and Leading to the Work Efficiency of Employees in Government Saving Bank, Head Office (Doctoral dissertation, Silpakorn University). http://ithesis-ir.su.ac.th/dspace/handle/123456789/2010.
- Nawawi, J., & Lambali, S. (2023). Optimizing Employee Performance through Timeliness in the Department of Population and Civil Registration of Bone Regency. KnE Social Sciences, 595-603. https://knepublishing.com/index.php/KnE-Social/article/view/14153.
- Oktyawati, D., & Fajri, F. A. (2019). The influence of accounting internal control and human resources capacity on reliability and timeliness of regional

- government financial reporting (a study in Special Region of Yogyakarta Province). Jurnal Perspektif Pembiayaan Dan Pembangunan Daerah, 6(4), 525-534. <a href="https://online-journal.unja.ac.id/JES/article/view/6286">https://online-journal.unja.ac.id/JES/article/view/6286</a>.
- Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD) (2010). Public Governance and Territorial Development Directorate. <a href="https://www.oecd.org/gov">https://www.oecd.org/gov</a>.
- Reis, H. T., & Gable, S. L. (2015). Responsiveness. Current Opinion in Psychology, 1, 67-71. <a href="https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/abs/pii/S2352250X1500">https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/abs/pii/S2352250X1500</a> 0482.
- Republic Act No. 6734, An Act providing for an organic act for the Autonomous Region in Muslim Mindanao (1989). https://www.officialgazette.gov.ph/1989/08/01/republic-act-no-6734/.
- Republic Act No. 9054, An act to strengthen and expand the organic act for the Autonomous Region in Muslim Mindanao, amending Republic Act No. 6734 (2001) for the purpose. <a href="https://lawphil.net/statutes/repacts/ra2001/ra\_9054\_2001.html">https://lawphil.net/statutes/repacts/ra2001/ra\_9054\_2001.html</a>.
- Republic Act No. 11054, An Act Providing for the Organic Law for the *Bangsamoro* Autonomous Region in Muslim Mindanao, Repealing for the Purpose Republic Act No. 6734, Entitled "An Act Providing for An Organic Act for the Autonomous Region in Muslim Mindanao," As Amended by Republic Act No. 9054, Entitled "An Act to Strengthen and Expand the Organic Act for the Autonomous Region in Muslim Mindanao (2018). https://lawphil.net/statutes/repacts/ra2018/ra 11054 2018.html.
- Republic Act No. 11292, The Seal of Good Local Governance Act of 2019. https://www.officialgazette.gov.ph/downloads/2019/04apr/20190412-RA-11292-RRD.pdf.
- Rwigema, D. C. (2022). Impact of teacher's welfare on quality of education in East African Community: Theoretical perspective. The Strategic Journal of Business & Change Management, 9(1), 675-713.
- Sahari, S. B., Bin Jakpar, S., Balia, B., & Sulong, S. (2022). Timeliness of local government budgeting in Indonesia: Do internal audit function and political factors matter? International Journal of Economics & Management, 16(1).
- Sandall, H., Silva, L. M. C. E., & Queiroga, F. (2022). A comprehensive approach to job performance in the service sector: A systematic literature review. BAR-Brazilian Administration Review, 19(02), e210046.
- Seyam, A., Hinners, A., Freire, L., & Parbat, V. (2016). The timeliness of State and Local Governments by GASB: An evaluation of the efficacy of financial reports.
- The Province of North Cotabato, duly represented by Governor Jesus Sacdalan and Vice Governor Emmanuel Piñol, for and on his behalf, versus the government of the Republic of the Philippines Peace Panel on Ancestral Domain (GRP), represented by Sec. Rodolfo Garcia, Atty.

- Sedfrey Candelaria, Mark Ryan Sullivan, and Gen. Hermogenes Esperon, Jr. (2008). G.R. Nos. 183591, 183752, 183893, and 183951. https://lawphil.net/judjuris/juri2008/oct2008/gr\_183591ac\_2008.html.
- Tsitmideli, G., et. al. (2017). The relationship between subordinates and supervisors and the impact on job satisfaction and efficiency of the employees. In Strategic Innovative Marketing: 5th IC-SIM, Athens, Greece 2016 (pp. 57-61). Springer International Publishing.
- UNDESA (2015). In pursuit of responsible and responsive local governance: Perspective from civil society on Local Governance in South Africa. https://desapublications.un.org.
- Yakin, D. C. (2013). The Influence of Policy Implementation, Individual Characteristics, and Organizational Characteristics on Work Motivation and Performance of Village Secretaries in Mojokerto Regency. DIA: Journal of Public Administration, 11(01), 129-145.
  - Zainal Abidin, N. Z., Singaravelloo, K., & Azizan, I. S. (2018). Responsiveness and the influence to public trust: the study on local government service delivery. Journal of Administrative Science, 15(1).
  - Zulkarnain, M. I. (2016). The Influence of Leadership, Work Motivation and Remuneration on Employee Performance at the Regional Office of the Directorate General of Taxes in East Java I. DIA: Journal of Public Administration, 14(2).