BUREAUCRATIC REFORM: ANALYSIS OF WORK FROM ANYWHERE POLICY PLANS FOR ASN

Mahir Pratama,
Postgraduate, Faculty of Administrative Sciences,
University of Indonesia,
mahir.pratama@ui.ac.id;

Lisman Manurung,
Postgraduate, Faculty of Administrative Sciences,
University of Indonesia,
lisman.manurung@ui.ac.id;

ABSTRACT

The government plans a WFA policy for ASN in 2023. This is based on a good assessment of WFH and WFO during the COVID-19 pandemic. This plan is also in line with the agenda of Bureaucratic Reform and e-government. The purpose of this paper is to find out the policy narrative developed by the government for WFA and the potential challenges that will be faced by the government as well as to what extent the government is ready to implement WFA policies for ASN. The method used is a postpositivist approach with Narrative Policy Analysis (NPA) analytical instruments with secondary data obtained from scientific journals, mass media and relevant public data. As a result, the government must make a comprehensive study related to WFA and issue special rules for WFA that regulate the system of performance, assessment, monitoring, and evaluation. It also requires job criteria and ASN who can perform WFA. Improving the quality of human resources and digital infrastructure is also a requirement for conducting WFA.

Keywords: Bureaucratic Reform, Work From Anywhere, Narrative Policy Analysis

A. INTRODUCTION

Currently, there is a lot of discussion about the government's plan to carry out a new work pattern for State Civil Apparatus (ASN) who can do work from and at any time or Work From Anywhere (WFA). This discourse arose because, during the COVID-19 pandemic, the central and local governments carried out a Work From Home (WFH) system and worked from an office or Work From Office (WFO) which was regulated dynamically and adaptively according to instructions from the government regarding policies. COVID-19. This work system is considered successful and has proven to be quite adaptive in serving the needs of the community with digital transformation in the government sphere (Hamdani, 2022). According to the Public Relations of the State Civil Service Agency (BKN), the hybrid work system during COVID-19 had a positive impact on the effectiveness of ASN performance, digitization that led to e-government
also showed good progress and of course, the community's need for public services could be carried out properly through digitization (Hardiantoro, 2022).

The latest data from the United Nations (UN) in the E-Government Development Index (EGDI) shows good results for Indonesia in implementing e-government over the past few years COVID-19 pandemic. The results of the Electronic-Based Government System (SPBE) released by the UN in July 2020 showed an increase in Indonesia's ranking from the previous two years. In 2018 it was ranked 107 and rose 19 places in 2020, namely 88. In addition, the participation of people using digital services also showed an increase. Data on e-participation in 2018 was ranked 92 and in 2020 experienced a significant increase, which was up 35 ranks and was ranked 57 for e-participation (Division for public institutions and digital government, 2020). Based on this, according to the government, the WFA policy plan will be able to increase the effectiveness of the bureaucracy.

In addition, according to Parker's research (2020), the tendency of employees to work from home is greater and can increase productivity given the absence of fatigue and stress factors when employees work from home (Parker, 2020). A study by Mallet et al., 2020 revealed that there is around 75 per cent of employees believe WFH can increase work productivity more than in the office (Mallet, et al., 2020). This indicates that working from home or anywhere can minimize employee stress levels and increase productivity.

According to KemenPAN-RB, the WFA policy plan for ASN is in line with bureaucratic reform for simplification. Judging from the substance, the government is trying to streamline the organizational structure, carry out impasse from structural to functional and implement a more agile, collaborative and dynamic work system. In the future, the monitoring and assessment system for ASN that implements WFA can refer to Ministerial Regulation (Permen) 8/2022 regarding the PNS Performance Management System (Aida, 2022).
However, this ASN policy plan for WFA reaps pros and cons in the community. Many argue that public services cannot be maximized if ASN conducts WFA. According to a public policy expert, Agus Pambagio, WFA policies for ASN require a more in-depth study and improve many sectors, such as monitoring ASN performance, sanctions for those who do not reach targets and improving digital infrastructure where there are many disparities (Putri, 2022a). Seeing the effectiveness of the WFH implementation, at least several factors be the focus of the government in the future in implementing WFA including the work environment, employee discipline and supervision that simultaneously affect the effectiveness of WFH implementation (Nusantara, 2022).

Based on the discussion above, WFA becomes a paradigm for the future work system that is linear with bureaucratic reform. However, this work system must be accompanied by rules and regulations that can monitor the productivity of ASN in public services. For this reason, this paper analyzes how the government's policy narrative for WFA and the challenges and readiness of the government to implement WFA policies for ASN. The purpose of this paper is to find out the policy narrative developed by the government for WFA and what are the potential challenges that will be faced by the government and to what extent the government is ready to implement WFA policies for ASN.

B. LITERATURE REVIEW

Bureaucratic Reform

Paradigms in the bureaucracy have been adapted and implemented based on the context of a country in terms of social, historical, cultural and political systems (Gaus et al., 2017). This means that each country has its views and approaches to interpreting its bureaucracy. According to the Coordinating Ministry for Human Development and Culture, Bureaucratic Reform is a government effort toward good governance in changing the government system, especially those related to institutions or organizations, governance and human resources (Indarti, 2021). According to Turner et al (2022) bureaucracy is a way to organize organizations in the public sector that has been formed for a long time with an ever-evolving paradigm and generally manages large-scale organizations and managers (Turner et al., 2022).

Bureaucratic reform in Indonesia is carried out in eight areas of change, namely structuring legislation, strengthening organizations, strengthening governance, HR management systems, supervision, change management, improving the quality of public services and performance accountability. In addition, there is an acceleration program in bureaucratic reform with seven principles, namely easy and fast, convincing, leveraging, independent, motivating, improving and having an impact (Ministry of Administrative Reform and Bureaucratic Reform, 2011). Thus, the government carries out a strategy in implementing bureaucratic reform, namely by strengthening the role of the leader, the program must be directed and focused, on understanding the gaps and complexity of competencies. This strategy is carried out to answer the challenges experienced by the government over the last 10 years. These obstacles are in the
form of political pressure, silo mentality and an exclusive bureaucracy (Indarti, 2021).

In implementing bureaucratic reform, a dynamic government is needed which can be realized by adaptive policies with resources that have to think ahead skills (skills in analyzing the future with a focus on new opportunities and possible threats faced, think again (skills in evaluating and identifying existing policies to have good results for future policies) and think cross (skills to think out of the box and adopt innovation ideas). In applying these skills, able people and agile processes are needed. Competent human resources and work systems are agile and agile (Sururi et al., 2019). A dynamic bureaucracy will have an impact on increasing the country's development concerning reference to policies that are adaptive to very fast changes in the socio-economic field which are the government's territory in issuing policies and carrying out supervision. According to Kasim (2003) in solving complex and dynamic government problems, a comprehensive strategy is needed which is divided into four areas, namely political leadership, implementation of a merit system in government institutions, harmonization of political policies in the form of rules and policy flows and government free from corruption (Kasim, 2013).

**Work From Anywhere (WFA)**

In general, Work From Anywhere (WFA) is a concept of flexible work systems and rules with changes in work patterns that employees can do anytime and anywhere. This pattern of rules consists of 1) Flexy time, flexible work schedule 2) Shifting or job sharing, a flexible number of working hours and 3) Flexibility in the place of work, flexible for the place of work (Georgetown University Law Center, 2010). According to Kelliher and Anderson in Simanjuntak et al (2019) the implementation of WFA is projected to be a solution for the future in increasing job satisfaction, work-life balance, agency commitment and encouraging employees to provide optimal performance (Simanjuntak et al., 2019).

Employees who are given the freedom to work are required to be able to meet the target of maximum performance output by putting aside the process of how they get it. The WFA concept has been applied to the WFO and WFH patterns which are arranged on a scheduled basis by the leadership of a section in the organization in preventing COVID-19 in the workplace. This WFA was first conducted in the UK in 2004 based on the need and awareness that employees need a flexible working system and time without compromising performance. This flexibility can be in the form of part-time, term-time, job-sharing or even flexi-time which is generally applied to female workers. This work system can help women workers to fulfil finances and take care of the household (Fadhila & Wicaksana, 2020).

The shift in the work system in the government sector has also occurred in various countries, including Australia. The Australian Government instructed its employees to work flexibly in suppressing the spread of COVID-19 while still maximizing public services running well. Options for WFA for Australian government employees consist of 1) Working remotely / remotely 2) Starting and ending work flexibly and 3) Job sharing or job sharing with fellow employees.
(Queensland Government, 2020). In addition, the middle east countries also made changes to the work system. Like the countries of Morocco and Palestine that do one intranet to connect all government agencies and ministries. ASN who work from home are provided with laptop facilities and install the required software, and applications and are given guidance related to teleworking (Sigmaweb, 2020).

The steps for reforming from a rigid bureaucracy to agile governance can be done by simplifying positions along with strengthening employee skills so that they can carry out their duties and functions to the maximum. This symptom is evidence that the New Public Service has been implemented but caution is still needed in carrying it out. This paradigm requires the government to collaborate and carry out good governance with stakeholders. There are at least three important requirements needed by the government so that work flexibility can be carried out, namely 1) a collaborative, dynamic and networked bureaucracy. If the government applies these three principles, it means that the government can no longer work alone, but must collaborate and network with stakeholders and parts or units within the government as well.

C. METHOD

This study uses a postpositivist approach to analyzing the policy story plan that will be decided by policy actors and the community. The selection of this approach is carried out to provide an overview of the phenomenon under study with analysis which later is expected to obtain findings and recommendations from existing problems (Daniarsyah & Rahayu, 2020). The analytical instrument used in this research is Narrative Policy Analysis (NPA) in examining the discourse of government policy. NPA is a method for viewing policy debates that create uncertainty and confusion (The Open University, 2017). In the study of public policy, the narrative describes the understanding of policy actors regarding problems and solutions derived from the empirical and the position of policy actors in the government system. For this reason, this policy narrative can be an important resource (Martinez, 2019).

According to Shanahan (2017), in research using the NPA instrument, it is necessary to determine the level of analysis as the scope of the research. There are three levels of analysis, namely micro, messo and macro. At the micro level, it covers the individuals who make the narration and the objects that are subject to the narration. At the messo level, the scope consists of the roles of policy actors with stakeholders in the formulation of public policies. At the macro level, it relates to ideology, and norms in the policy process. In addition to the research level, in this NPA analysis, there are two important aspects, namely narrative elements and narrative context. Narrative elements consist of setting, characters or actors, plot, and policy solutions or messages. While the narrative context is divided into a value system (belief system) and strategy (Shanahan et al., 2018).

For this reason, in this study, the level of analysis is the messo level by analyzing policy actors, namely the National Civil Service Agency (BKN) and the Ministry of Administrative Reform and Bureaucratic Reform (Kemenpan-RB) with groups that are resistant to the WFA policy. The data used are secondary data
from public data, mass media, and previous scientific journals that support and are by following the research topic.

D. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

WFA Policy Narrative

This WFA was first conducted in the UK in 2004 based on the need and awareness that employees need a flexible working system and time without compromising performance. This flexibility can be in the form of part-time, term-time, job-sharing or even flexi-time which is generally applied to female workers. This work system can help women workers to fulfil finances and take care of the household (Fadhila & Wicaksana, 2020). However, with COVID-19, this work system is forced to be carried out in the government sector, including in Indonesia. WFA itself was introduced by the Minister of Finance as Flexible Work Arrangement (WFA), which is an alternative work system found in organizations in determining the place and time of work so that WFA can focus more on employee performance results than work procedures (Daniarsyah & Rahayu, 2020). The government assesses that the WFA work system will be more effective and efficient if viewed from the budget, time and place. For this reason, this plan was initiated by the Menpan-RB on the basis that so far the government has carried out SPBE which can be carried out by ASN without any space limitations with the support of information technology. This plan is being reviewed by BKN with the concept of adopting the WFH and WFO models during COVID-19 (Saptohutomo, 2022).

The implementation of digital-based government is currently a necessity at every level of the bureaucracy. The consequences of the existence of the WFO and WFH regulations are new patterns and work systems in agile bureaucratic reform. In a flexible work pattern later, it must remain oriented to public services and employee performance. To achieve this, bureaucratic reform in line with this, the government divides into four agendas, namely structural, cultural, regulatory and digital transformation reforms. The four agendas require no short time. There needs to be commitment and leadership, especially on the last agenda related to digital transformation. This can support the implementation of WFA.

In the third bureaucratic reform covering eight areas of change, adjustments need to be made due to COVID-19. Current conditions require the government to act normally considering the demand in the community regarding public services is not like before COVID-19. The silo mentality that exists in the bureaucracy is also homework for bureaucratic reform. The target of eight areas in bureaucratic reform is considered a burden, not an opportunity in the public service system in general, for example collaborating. Such as Bappenas in collaboration with the Ministry of Finance related to the budget, BPK and KPK related to accountability. This collaboration is not enough to just be written, but it requires a clear division of tasks, functions and responsibilities. Especially during the current pandemic, which encourages efficiency and effectiveness so that later bureaucratic reform can run optimally.

WFA is not only talking about flexibility in time and place to work but more about the impact that can improve the country. If we review the quick wins
program which is part of bureaucratic reform, several activities are linear with this WFA. Such as employees who are at work and separated from their families so that it can trigger inflexibility, even though the work can be done remotely. Stunting can also be suppressed by giving time for mothers with ASN status to have more time with their children in their development with the WFA system with a record that performance must remain maximal. Of course, this will increase the wider urban district to be suitable for children.

However, many doubt and even reject the government's policy plan for this WFA. One of them is the provincial government of South Sumatra. The Governor of South Sumatra revealed that the central government needs to first make an inventory of ASN with job criteria that can carry out WFA, WFH or WFO. The implementation of WFA can be adapted to the needs of each local government (Kumparan.com, 2022). Several academics and public policy observers also highlighted the WFA plan. The issue of ASN productivity and the readiness of digital infrastructure as well as technical regulations are requirements to be fulfilled (Putri, 2022b)

Several points in the narrative above describe the narrative at the level of analysis, setting, and character related to research along with strategies and belief systems (Table 1).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Narrative Form</th>
<th>Analysis Level</th>
<th>Setting</th>
<th>Plot</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Analysis Level</td>
<td>• Messo: the government as a policy-making actor by planning WFA for ASN and getting criticism from various community groups, academics and even local governments as well.</td>
<td>• The PAN-RB Ministry plans a WFA for ASN which is welcomed by BKN by conducting a study. This is based on the WFH and WFO assessments of ministries/agencies during COVID-19 which are considered effective</td>
<td>• Bureaucratic reform that carries the target of streamlining structure and agility in the bureaucracy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Setting</td>
<td>• Protagonists (heroes): Government (Kemenpan-RB and BKN) • Antagonists (villain): Community groups, academics, and local governments who criticize WFA • Victims: people in need of public services who are affected by the immature WFA plan</td>
<td></td>
<td>• The COVID-19 pandemic requires the government to carry out WFH and WFO adjusted to the status of increasing cases in each region</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Plot</td>
<td>• The PAN-RB Ministry plans a WFA for ASN which is welcomed by BKN by conducting a study. • The emergence of resistance and criticism from several community groups, academics and local government</td>
<td></td>
<td>• The government continues to review the WFA plan for</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

269
Moral message
ASN considering the good results with this remote work system. In other aspects, it can also save budget and is linear with bureaucratic reform and e-government

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Narrative context</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Belief System</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strategy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1. Narrative components in the WFA Plan for ASN
Source: Author's analysis

Challenges of WFA Implementation
In the implementation of the WFA work system, there have been many studies related to effectiveness by experts, but implementation in Indonesia will encounter several challenges, namely:
a) Aspects of conventional leadership that are currently still carried out by leading officials. This means that the system and work patterns still use the old system, namely that their subordinates must be physically present at the office (CNBC Indonesia, 2022).
b) Geographical aspect. Currently, there are still many areas in Indonesia that have blank spot status. There are 9,113 regions recorded in the 3T region and 3,345 non-3 T regions with blank spot status with a total of 12,548 regions (Herman, 2021). Thus, the implementation of e-government in the area cannot be carried out.
c) The public's scepticism thinks that the productivity and performance of ASN will decrease and public services will be hampered if WFA is implemented. For this reason, it is necessary to determine from the Kemenpan-RB in deciding which region or part of the position to implement WFA and not implement WFA. So that the decision can be quickly disseminated to ASN and the wider community (Amrynoun, 2022).

Government Readiness and Best Practice
Even though this policy is a follow-up policy from the work pattern during the COVID-19 pandemic, the government needs to make preparations for changes in governance. Preparations that need to be done by the government include:
a) Digital infrastructure. E-government needs to be supported by base transceiver station (BTS) infrastructure, servers, and bandwidth in supporting the implementation of e-government. This is a requirement in the implementation of the WFA policy.
b) Human resources. The implementation of WFA must be accompanied by ASN's ability to operate digital programs and tools. Training and adaptation need to be carried out by related institutions to ASN conducting WFA.
c) Work procedures. Ministries and institutions that implement WFA need to make new formulations that serve as a reference for WFA implementation, such as performance appraisals, monitoring systems, attendance and evaluations related to the WFA work system. Aspects of sanctions also need to be prepared for ASN who are resistant to this new work pattern.

d) Big data. The government needs to prepare a synchronous data source between related departments and institutions, both central and local governments to ensure maximum decision-making and public services.

e) Regulation. This is the most basic part that must be prepared by the government. WFA rules may adopt some of the rules used during WFH and WFO implementation during the COVID-19 pandemic. The latest rules to support WFA are contained in Permenpan-RB 8/2021 regarding ASN Performance Management which consists of performance development, implementation, monitoring, evaluation of performance results and information systems that support working remotely. In addition, there are also regulations related to monitoring ASN performance, namely PP 24/2021 and BKN Regulation 6/2022 in implementing the PP. However, the regulations listed above require further development of technical WFA regulations such as the budget and the impact of WFA needs to be studied more deeply. The cost-benefit analysis instrument can be a measuring tool in the implementation of WFA. This instrument can measure the extent of the costs and benefits generated by this WFA plan.

In addition to preparation, the government needs to study the experience of countries that have previously implemented the WFA work system. Brazil is a developing country that has implemented this WFA work system. With a remote work system, Brazil has made efficient in the implementation of its government. Through the remote work system during the COVID-19 pandemic, the Brazilian government estimates that it has saved around 1 billion rials or around 2.97 trillion rupiah (Exchange rate of 1 Brazilian real = 2974 Indonesian rupiah, as of 8 June 2022). According to a report released by the Brazilian Ministry of the Economy, the savings came from 859 million rials of fixed costs for the physical maintenance of the office and around 161 million rials which came from the reduction in benefits received by employees from April to August 2020. Costs such as internet, telephone and electricity were borne by employees who choose to work from home or from anywhere. Overtime rules have been regulated separately from WFA rules and other costs (Marl, 2020).

According to Martins et al (2021), the percentage of employees who do remote work is around 65 per cent for professional workers and researchers, 61 per cent for echelon II and III, 30 per cent for technicians, 41 per cent for administrative employees, 0 per cent for TNI-Polri and firefighters (Martins et al., 2021). The percentage of various types of work shows that not all employees can perform WFA, especially for employees who are technical in nature and related to security. The more technical the work, the smaller the percentage for doing WFA. Vice versa, jobs such as researchers have the highest percentage of WFA because they do not require intensive physical presence. Lessons from Brazil regarding WFA can be adopted for the Indonesian government with several types of work
and the percentage of WFA that must be adjusted. In addition, costs such as electricity and data packages are borne by employees who choose WFA. The implementation of some of these technical rules can of course be carried out while still paying attention to the professionalism of ASN by the provisions of Law 5/2014 regarding the State Civil Apparatus.

**E. CONCLUSION**

The government as a policy-making actor by planning WFA for ASN and getting criticism from various community groups, academics and even local governments. Challenges also come from the conventional leadership style of officials, geographical conditions and public skepticism. However, WFA is a necessity for the government in changing the post-COVID-19 work system to support e-government. In the future, the government needs to prepare technical rules related to performance and assessment systems, inventory of ASN and job criteria that can be WFA, prepare digital infrastructure and conduct pilot projects at ministries/agencies and local governments to conduct WFA.

**REFERENCES**


Amrynudin, A. D. . (2022). WACANA KEBIJAKAN WORK FROM ANYWHERE (WFA) BAGI ASN.


