

IMPLEMENTATION OF PARKING SERVICE RETRIBUTION POLICY ON THE EDGE OF PUBLIC ROADS OF SUKABUMI CITY

Delia Arsa Aulia Putri

Faculty of Administration and Humanities,
Muhammadiyah University of Sukabumi,
arsadelia12@ummi.ac.id;

M Rijal Amirulloh

Faculty of Administration and Humanities,
Muhammadiyah University of Sukabumi,
mrijalamirulloh@ummi.ac.id;

Andi Mulyadi

Faculty of Administration and Humanities,
Muhammadiyah University of Sukabumi,
andimulyadi@ummi.ac.id

ABSTRACT

The title of this study is "Implementation of the Policy for Parking Service Charges on the Side of Public Roads in the City of Sukabumi". The purpose of this study is regarding parking services on public roads. This research found several problems, namely the ticket was not realized when collecting parking fees and the lack of Human Resources (HR) in supervising parking attendants. The method used in this research is using qualitative research with data collection techniques using observation, interview and documentation techniques. In determining the informants in this study using the Snowball Sampling technique. The theory applied in this research is the policy implementation theory of Donald S. Van Meter and Carl E. Van Horn which is influenced by 6 dimensions. The results of implementing this policy conclude that the Implementation of Policy on Regional Regulation Number 16 of 2011 Regarding Parking Service Fees on the Side of Public Roads in the City of Sukabumi, that there are policies that have not obtained optimal results in line with the goals and objectives that have been set. If you look at the number of tickets that were not given and the lack of supervision.

Keywords: *Policy Implementation, Parking Service Retribution*

A. PRELIMINARY

Retribution for parking services on the side of public roads is a service area that is provided and managed by the local government in accordance with the provisions of the regulations that have been set. Public roadside parking services are levied on the basis of using or utilizing the parking spaces provided by the government. The level of collection for the use of parking services is measured according to the type of vehicle that has been stipulated in the policy. Parking is also a form of Regional Original Income generated by the Sukabumi City Transportation Service. The policy regarding parking collection is regulated in the

Regulations.Region No.16 of 2011 Article 8 concerning Parking Service Charges on Public Roadsides explains that:

Compulsory Retribution as referred to in Article 4 paragraph (2), is obliged to pay Retribution whose structure and amount of tariffs are determined as follows:

- a. Two-wheeled and three-wheeled motorized vehicles Rp. 1,000.00 (one thousand rupiah) each time parking.
- b. Four-wheeled motorized vehicles, sedans, jeeps, mini buses, pick-ups, and the like, amounting to Rp. 2000.00 (two thousand rupiah) each time parking.

Motor vehicles, goods cars and buses, types of:

- 1) Pick Up and the like as well as a single two-wheel axle truck for Rp. 3,000.00 (three thousand rupiah) each time parking.
- 2) Two-wheel axle trucks, three-wheel axle trucks, trailer trucks, attached trucks, medium buses, and large buses Rp. 5,000.00 (five thousand rupiah) each time parking.

It is also explained in Article 11 which states that fees are collected using a Regional Retribution Decree (SKRD) or an equivalent document. Other documents that are equated as referred to can be in the form of tickets, coupons and subscription cards according to the type of vehicle. In other words, so that there is definite clarity regarding the amount of the fare that must be paid and there is clarity regarding the total number of parking users through tickets that have been issued, so that there is clarity about the income from the parking levy.



Figure 1 Parking ticket on the side of the public road in Sukabumi City
source: (Sukabumi City Transportation Service 2022)

The picture above is a parking ticket to be given to parking users every time they are parked by parking attendants according to the type of vehicle. Parking fees are one of the potentials that are managed to become a source of regional revenue originating from within the territory. This becomes a benchmark in assessing the level of local revenue obtained by the region. The proceeds from this revenue will be allocated for the development of the area itself, particularly in building facilities and means of repairing parking lots which will have an impact on governance in the implementation of parking that runs well and does not disturb other road users.

However, based on the results of initial observations the researcher saw the phenomenon that using tickets had not been carried out optimally. There are still many parking attendants who do not give tickets to parking lot users, because giving tickets is one of the tools to find out the amount of fees that must be issued,

with that there is non-transparency when quoting parking fees and affects the amount of revenue earned and can be detrimental to several parties particularly for parking lots. This can be seen from the following table:

Table: Recapitulation of Receipt and Use of Parking Retribution Tickets by Year 2019 - 2021

Ticket type	2019 year		2020 year		Year 2021	
	Reception	usage	Reception	usage	Reception	usage
ticket 1000	1,066,488	715,755	1,313,427	1,107,335	1,199,541	944,416
Ticket 2000	715,749	461,260	649,778	329,184	517,531	296,690
Ticket 3000	498,518	277,903	156,308	63,509	171,143	82,389
Amount		2,471,984		1,956,230		1,784,963

Source: (Sukabumi City Transportation Service 2022)

Based on the table above, it can be seen that the remaining number of tickets for the type of ticket is Rp. 1,000, Rp. 2,000 and Rp. 3,000 was not realized properly by parking attendants who were not given to their users when collecting parking fees so that parking service users did not know the amount of the fee that had to be issued each time they parked. This also affects the non-transferable income that parking attendants get every day and does not know the number of two-wheeled and four-wheeled vehicles parked at each point of the parking area.

In addition to the large number of tickets that were not realized properly, the supervision carried out by the Sukabumi City Transportation Service at the points of the road segments that are managed as parking lots has not been carried out optimally due to the lack of available Human Resources (HR) which is not comparable to the points of roads managed by the UPT Sukabumi City Transportation Service parking lot.

Table: List of Roads Managed by the UPT Parking Department of Transportation, Sukabumi City

1	- Jl. Jend. Sudirman
2	- Jl. Jend. A. Yani
3	- Jl. Gudang
4	- Jl. Solar Kencana
5	- Jl. Dewi Sartika
6	- Jl. Ir. H. Juanda
7	- Jl. R.E. Martadinata
8	- Jl. Perintis Kemerdekaan
9	- Jl. Mayawati
10	- Jl. Yulius Usman

11	- Jl. Arif Rahman Hakim
12	- Jl. Lettu Bakri
13	- Jl. Pasundan
14	- Jl. Kelengteng
15	- Jl. Pejagalan
16	- Jl. Pelabuhan II
17	- Jl. Tipar Gede
18	- Jl. Stasiun Timur
19	- Jl. Perniagaan
20	- Jl. Kapt. H. Kabir
21	- Jl. Ciwangi
22	- Jl. Pasar Ciwangi
23	- Jl. Pasar Wetan/Pasar Pelita
24	- Jl. Brawijaya
25	- Jl. Selabintana
26	- st. Siliwangi
27	- Jl. Cikole dalem
28	- Jl. Rumah Sakit Belakang
29	- st. Pabuaran
30	- Jl. Zaenal Zakse
31	- Jl. Tekwat
32	- Jl. Mochtar Obing
33	- Jl. Kartini
34	- Jl. Sriwijaya
35	- Jl. Mesjid
36	- Jl. Baledesa
37	- Jl. R Syamsudin. S.H
38	- Jl. Veteran

Source: (Sukabumi City Transportation Service 2022)

From the data table above it can be seen that there are 38 roads managed by the UPT Parking Department of Transportation of the City of Sukabumi which are used as parking lots, so that the supervision carried out by the Parking UPT has not been carried out optimally on certain road sections. Of the 38 roads managed by researchers to serve as research, researchers took Jalan Jend. Sudirman and Jalan Kapt. H. Kabir for research. Based on the explanation above that has been described, the researcher is interested in conducting research with the title "Implementation of Parking Service Retribution Policies on the Side of Public Roads in the City of Sukabumi".

B. LITERATURE REVIEW

Public policy

Public policies are policies developed by government agencies and officials. In his book *Public Policy Making*, Anderson (1979: 3) says that: a purposeful action followed by an actor or a group of actors in dealing with a problem or problem is of concern. As for public policy, Dye (1992:2) says that public policy is whatever the government chooses to do or not to do. The definition of public policy according to Dye implies that public policy is made by the government, not private organizations and concerns choices that must be made or not made by government agencies. If the government chooses to do something, there must be a purpose and the country's policies must cover all government actions, not merely a statement of the will of the government or its officials. Based on the various definitions from the experts above, researchers argue that public policy is an action that is carried out or not carried out by government agencies with the aim of solving public problems and for the public interest. The policy to do something is contained in statutory regulations made by government agencies so that they are coercive and binding.

Policy Implementation.

Policy implementation is actions taken either by individuals, officials, or government or private groups that are directed at achieving the goals outlined in policy decisions. Policy implementation is also one of the activities in the public policy process. As according to Edward III (1980:1) Policy Implementation Is the stage of decision making between the formation of a policy and the consequences of the policy will affect several aspects of life. Furthermore, according to Van Horn and Van Meter (1975: 447) argue that "Implementation includes actions by the public and private individuals or groups) directed at achieving the goals set in prior policies and decisions". On the other hand, Jones (1996: 296) argues that Implementation is an activity intended to operate a program. In principle, policy implementation is a way for a policy to achieve its goals. To implement public policy, there are two choices of steps that exist, namely directly implementing in the form of programs or through the formulation of public policy (Nugroho, 2003: 185).

Policy implementation is a process to realize the goals that have been selected and set to become reality (Tahir, 2015: 56). If a policy is taken correctly, then the possibility of failure can still occur, if the implementation process is not good and optimal, then the policy fails to achieve the goals set by the makers. This implies that policy implementation in substance is the right way to implement it so that a good policy can achieve the goals set by policy makers.

Based on the various definitions of the experts above, that policy implementation is a planned application to fulfill and achieve goals that have been prepared carefully and carefully. Policy implementation has a very important position in policy making.

Implementation Model of Donald S.Van Meter and Carl E.Van Horn

If policy implementation is to be said to be effective, it is necessary to pay attention to the 6 principal implementation policies in the Van Meter and Van Horn model (1975: 462), A Model of the Policy Implementation Process, this

model is influenced by 6 interrelated independent dimensions, the dimensions these are:

1. Policy standards and targets: Policy standards and targets must be clear and measurable so that they can be realized. Then it will be easily measured with several problems.
2. Resources: these resources can include funds or other incentives within the program that can encourage and facilitate effective implementation.
3. Inter-organizational communication and strengthening activities: Effective implementation needs to be understood by those who are responsible for achieving it, so that consistency (uniformity) is communicated by various sources of information.
4. Characteristics of implementing agents: The characteristics of implementing agents include bureaucracy, norms, and patterns of relationships that occur within the bureaucracy, all of which will affect the implementation of a program.
5. Social, economic and political environment: This variable includes environmental economic resources that can support the successful implementation of policies, the extent to which interest groups are the characteristics of the participants.
6. Attitude of implementers/Disposition: The attitude of acceptance and rejection of policy implementing agents will affect the success or failure of public policy implementation.

C. METHOD

The research method used by researchers in this study is the Qualitative-description method because this method is used to answer the objectives of this study regarding the Policy for Parking Service Charges on the Side of Public Roads in the City of Sukabumi. It can be seen that qualitative research is a method that emphasizes an important matter and understands the phenomenon of the problems experienced by researchers. In this case, relating to research that researchers will do. Setting informants or determining informants in this study, researchers used the Snowball sampling technique. The technique of determining a sample that is initially small in number, then enlarges. In this case, if the previously selected informant to answer this research is still not enough, the researcher will add informants if needed. Data collection techniques used in this study are observation, interviews or interviews and documentation. The three data collection techniques are used to obtain data and information to complement the extent of Implementation of the Parking Ticket Policy on Public Roadsides in the City of Sukabumi. The validation technique used in this study is triangulation.

In this study, researchers used triangulation of sources and techniques to obtain the validity of data from informants who had been interviewed by researchers. In triangulation of sources, this is done by asking questions related to the implementation of tickets on public roads with other parties who are still related to the research problem. Whereas in technical triangulation, the researcher collects data obtained from interviews and observations, then checks based on documents obtained in the field. Data analysis carried out in this study was to

collect data by entering the research environment and collecting research data, reducing data by selecting, focusing on simplification, abstracting and changing data that emerged from written records in the field. presentation of data to provide the possibility of drawing conclusions and taking action and taking conclusions/verification of the data that has been analyzed. Findings can be in the form of a description or description of an object that is supported by valid and credible informants.

The theory in this study uses the theory of Donald S.Van Meter and Carl E.Van Horn. This is because the theory is able to answer questions related to the Implementation of the Parking Service Retribution Policy on the Side of Public Roads in the City of Sukabumi. The dimensions in this policy implementation approach include policy standards and targets, resources, inter-organizational communication and activity reinforcement, characteristics of implementing agents, social, economic and political environment, and attitudes of executors/dispositions.

D. EXPLANATION

Implementation is a form of operationalizing or organizing activities that have been determined by law and become a collective agreement among various stakeholders, actors, organizations (public or private), procedures and techniques that are synergistically driven to work together to implement policies towards certain desired (Solichin 2012: 133). Implementation is also one of the things that influence the success of a policy. Donald S.Van Meter and Carl E.Van Horn's policy implementation variable is a dimension of policy implementation that researchers will use as a tool for analysis in this study. Researchers use the dimensions in the theory of Donal S.Van Meter and Carl E.Van Horn, because the dimensions contained in the policy implementation model of Donald S.Van Meter and Carl E.Van Horn are components of the implementation of the Public Roadside Parking Service Retribution policy. There are 6 dimensions of policy implementation in the theory of Donal S.Van Meter and Carl E.Van Horn, namely policy standards and targets, resources, inter-organizational communication and strengthening activities, characteristics of implementing agents, social, economic and political environment and attitudes of executors/dispositions.

Policy Standards and Targets

The performance of policy implementation can be measured by the level of success from the size and objectives of policies that are realistic with the socio-culture that exists at the level of policy implementers. In measuring the performance of policy implementation, of course by confirming the standards and targets that must be achieved by policy implementers. Regarding the standards and targets in the policy for parking service fees, it states that the standards and targets have not been carried out optimally in parking service fees, in terms of targets that have not been optimal are the limited area of parking space which is the authority or task in the management carried out by the UPTD parking at the Transportation Service. Many sections of national and provincial roads where there are parking activities are not levied by the UPT parking of the Transportation Service. National and provincial roads are not included in the

management of the Department of Transportation, which is the authority or task of the Department of Transportation only on City roads, so that many national and provincial road sections are used for parking lots carried out by unofficial parking attendants and the collection they do enter into personal pockets and do not enter into Regional Original Income (PAD) so that it is included in illegal collection. Whereas in terms of standards, namely the collection of parking fees carried out by parking attendants, they still use cash payments or manually, because the collection of good parking fees is collection that uses non-cash payments that avoid leakage. so that many national and provincial road sections are used for parking lots that are carried out by unofficial parking attendants and the collection that is carried out goes into private pockets and does not enter into the Regional Original Revenue (PAD) so that it is included in illegal collection. Whereas in terms of standards, namely the collection of parking fees carried out by parking attendants, they still use cash payments or manually, because the collection of good parking fees is collection that uses non-cash payments that avoid leakage. so that many national and provincial road sections are used for parking lots that are carried out by unofficial parking attendants and the collection that is carried out goes into private pockets and does not enter into the Regional Original Revenue (PAD) so that it is included in illegal collection. Whereas in terms of standards, namely the collection of parking fees carried out by parking attendants, they still use cash payments or manually, because the collection of good parking fees is collection that uses non-cash payments that avoid leakage.



Figure 2 Illegal Parking

Source: (Researcher 2022)

In addition, policy stan... .. been carried out optimally because there are still illegal parking lots. Lack of public awareness of prohibition signs in parking vehicles or correct parking rules on the shoulder of the road, apart from that there are still lands or places that should not be used as parking lots instead used as parking lots by unauthorized parking attendants so that the results the levy does not enter into the Regional Original Revenue (PAD) but goes into his personal pocket.

Resource

The condition of running an organization is the ownership of resources. Resources are the main thing in implementing policies, both human resources and non-human resources. The success of a policy implementation is very dependent on the availability of resources, if there is a lack of resources in implementing the

policy implementation will not take place effectively. The available resources must be in accordance with the capabilities and expertise needed and have the right size, if the resources are lacking and not competent enough in their expertise will be a factor of failure in carrying out policy implementation.



Figure 3 UPT Parking Undertaking Supervision

Source: (Researcher 2022)

In terms of resources, namely human resources in carrying out the policy implementation process by the Sukabumi City Transportation Service in carrying out the Parking Service Fee on the Side of the Sukabumi City Public Road, based on the results it can be stated that the human resources available at the Sukabumi City Transportation Service in this case are not suitable due to limited resources. The number of available humans is not proportional to the parking space managed. supervision carried out by the Sukabumi City Transportation Service is felt to be lacking in the implementation of Parking Service Charges on the Side of Sukabumi City Public Roads. Supervision carried out by the UPT Parking Office of the Sukabumi City Transportation Service is carried out every day on certain roads starting from 08.00-12.00 WIB. Jl. Ir. H. Juanda, Jl. Dewi Sartika, Jl. Pelita Market, Jl. Ciwangi Market, Jl. Capt. H. Kabir and starting from 13.00 WIB supervision was carried out on Jl. Gen. A. Yani is a place that is prone to traffic jams and supervision is carried out on other road sections only at certain times.

Inter-Organizational Communication and Activity Reinforcement

In a policy that can be implemented effectively, the standards and goals need to be understood by the individual implementing the policy. Standards and objectives need to be communicated to policy implementers about what the standards and objectives are. Communication between organizations involved in the Retribution for Parking Services on Public Roads was carried out, it was stated that the communication carried out had gone well between organizations that played a role in the implementation of the policy.

The communication carried out by the UPT Parking Office of the Sukabumi City Transportation Service with parking attendants stated that the communication had been well established, in addition to providing directions and socialization in providing parking services on the side of public roads to parking lot users and in managing vehicles that parked on the side of a public road so that it looks neat and

orderly to avoid congestion, besides that the arrangement made by parking attendants must be in accordance with existing rules.



Figure 4 Directions to Parking Attendants
Source: (Researcher 2022)



Figure 5 Road Side Parking on Public Roads
Source: (Researcher 2022)

Directions made by UPT parking to parking attendants are carried out every day regarding parking arrangements on public roads. In using parking on the side of a public road, it must be in accordance with applicable regulations, if the parking arrangement is irregular, sanctions and direct guidance will be given in the field.

Characteristics of Executing Agents

These implementing agencies include formal organizations and informal organizations involved in implementing policies. The performance of policy implementation of the executors is influenced by the right characteristics and matches the implementing agents. This relates to the context of the policy to be implemented. Policy implementers are required to be disciplined and strict in several policies. The characteristics of the executors greatly influence the implementation of policies. One of the important factors in every bureaucracy is that there are SOPs (Standard Operating Procedures) which are guidelines for officials in carrying out the tasks or authorities set by the government. Good SOP (Standard Operating Procedures), which includes a clear framework, not convoluted and easily understood by anyone because it will become a reference in the work of policy implementers. The researcher also interviewed those regarding the SOP (Standard Operating Procedures) implementation of the parking service Retribution policy, based on the results of the interviews it was found that the implementation of standard operational policies was adjusted to the applicable

rules, the existing SOPs were very clear and easy to understand by policy implementers and not convoluted. In addition, regarding the SOP carried out by parking attendants it states that the operational standard carried out by parking attendants is to collect parking fees, In addition, the SOP (Standard Operating Procedures) for collectors receives the results from the parking fees given by parking attendants to collectors, while from the Parking UPTD, namely receiving the results of parking fees which will later be handed over to Bank BJB as regional treasury. The results of interviews with informant 3 regarding SOP (Standard Operating Procedures) stated that the SOP (Standard Operating Procedures) that had been carried out had been carried out optimally in accordance with the rules.

Social, economic and political environment

Things that need to be considered in the implementation of these policies are environmental conditions that encourage a successful implementation of the policy. It should be understood that the external environment has an important influence on policy implementation. A successful implementation is influenced by the support and rejection of the external environment, if the external environment supports the implementation of the policy will be successful and vice versa. Policy implementers play an active role in the implementation of this policy. From social, economic and political conditions, it can be assessed from the performance of the implementation of the Parking Retribution Policy on Public Roadsides in the City of Sukabumi, besides that it can be seen to what extent parking attendants and the community provide support for parking service fees. The condition of the economic environment is focused on managing parking fees, so the collection that has been carried out has been carried out optimally because there are areas of economic activity such as malls, shops, culinary and road sections adjacent to trading locations. Then in the social environment related to parking fees it has not been carried out optimally, because the collection has not yet been included in the targets of parking fees such as schools, mosques and health places. Meanwhile, in the political environment, parking fees are not the target in collecting parking fees. Then in the social environment that concerns parking fees it has not been carried out optimally, because the collection has not yet been included in the target parking fees such as schools, mosques and health places. Meanwhile, in the political environment, parking fees are not the target in collecting parking fees. Then in the social environment that concerns parking fees it has not been carried out optimally, because the collection has not yet been included in the target parking fees such as schools, mosques and health places. Meanwhile, in the political environment, parking fees are not the target in collecting parking fees.

Attitude of Executors/Disposition

Acceptance attitude and rejection from policy implementers will affect the success or failure of public policy implementation. Their attitude is influenced by their views on a policy and the way they see the effect of that policy on their organizational interests and personal interests. The attitude of the executors in implementing the policy of Parking Service Retribution on the Side of Public Roads in the City of Sukabumi in the results of interviews regarding the attitude

of the implementers in this policy stated that in the implementation of parking fees on the side of public roads, namely the attitude of agencies in exercising their authority is in accordance with and in harmony with the Regional Regulation on Service Retribution. Parking on the edge of public roads, with the applicable regional regulations, the implementation has been carried out optimally.

Parking service fees state that the service provided by parking attendants to their users is to provide good service and provide parking tickets to parking lot users, but there are parking lot users who refuse to accept the ticket and parking lot users also ignore the ticket in every time you park.



Figure 6 Parking Services at the Side of Public Roads

Source: (Researcher 2022)

If a parking ticket is needed and requested by the parking lot user, the parking attendant will give the parking ticket, if the ticket is not requested by the parking lot user, then there are parking attendants who don't give it, so there are only parking tickets. parking lot users do not know the tariff that must be issued.

E. CONCLUSION

Based on the findings that researchers have made in the field regarding the Implementation of the Parking Service Retribution Policy on Public Roadsides in the City of Sukabumi, as a whole it has been running optimally, but there are a number of things that are still not running optimally. It can be seen from the 6 dimensions that become a benchmark for how an Implementation of the Parking Service Retribution Policy on the Side of the Sukabumi City Public Road which was put forward by Donal S.Van Meter and Carl E.Van Horn, there are the following conclusions:

1. In the Standards and Policy Target dimensions, parking fees have not been carried out optimally due to the lack of parking area and the collection of parking fees is still done manually or cash payments have not been made in non-cash payments.

2. In terms of resources in implementing the policy, it is not yet comparable to the parking lots managed by the UPT parking of the Transportation Service, so that the supervision carried out by the parking UPT has not been carried out optimally.
3. In the dimensions of inter-organizational communication and activity reinforcement, it has been going well and has implemented the rules in accordance with the existing authorities and duties.
4. In the characteristic dimension, the implementing agency has done well in accordance with existing rules in implementing parking fees on public roads.
5. In the dimensions of the economic, social and political environment, it can be concluded that in terms of the economic environment, parking fees have been carried out optimally, while from the social and political environment, parking fees have not been included in the targets for collecting parking fees.
6. In the dimensions of the attitude of the implementers/dispositions of the UPT parking at the Transportation Service in carrying out their duties or authorities, they are in accordance with their respective duties and functions, but there are still parking attendants who do not carry out their duties properly, such as not giving parking tickets to parking lot users.

REFERENCE

- Anderson, JE (1979). *Public Policy Making*. New York : Holt, Rinehart and Wiston.
- Creswell, J. (2013). *Research Design Qualitative, Quantitative and Mixed Approaches*. Student Library.
- Dwijowijoto, RN (2003). *Formulation, Implementation, and Evaluation*. Jakarta : PT Elex Media Komputido Gramedia Group.
- Dye, TR (1992). *Understanding Public Policy*. United States Of America : Prentice-Hall, Inc. A Simon & Schuster Company.
- Edward III, G. . (1980). *Implementing Public Policy*. Washington DC : Congressional Quarterly Press.
- Horn, V. (1975). *The Policy Implementing Process: A Conceptual Framework*. administration & society. ohio state.
- Jones, C. . (1996). *Introduction to Public Policy (Translator)*. Jakarta : PT Raja Grafindo Persada.
- Moleong, LJ (2017). *Qualitative Research Methodology*. Bandung : PT.Remaja Roadakarya Offset.
- Satori, D. (2011). *Qualitative Research Methods*. Bandung : Alfabeta.
- Sugiyono. (2017). *Qualitative Research Methods, Quantitative and R & D*. Bandung: Alfabeta.
- Tahir, A. (2015). *Public Policy and Transparency in the Implementation of Regional Government*. Bandung : Alfabeta.
- Wahab, SA (2012). *Policy Analysis: From Formulation to Compilation of Public Policy Implementation Models*. Jakarta : Bumi Akrasa.

Rules and Laws

Regional Regulation Number 5 of 2018 concerning the Organization of

Transportation
Regional Regulation Number 16 of 2011 Challenges for Retribution for Parking
Services on Public Roads in the City of Sukabumi